

INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION FOR LADAKH STUDIES

LADAKH STUDIES

— 18, November 2003

CONTENTS

Editorial

News from the Association:

From the Hon. Sec.

News from Ladakh, including:

Death of Kushok Bakula Rinpoche

Hill Council for Kargil

Conference Report: IALS XIth Colloquium

Conference publications

Future IALS Colloquium at Kargil?

News from Members:

Articles:

Questions/Answers:

Chiru

Grim

Issues for Debate:

The IALS and Standards of Academic Conduct

On Plagiarism, Sources and Informants

Dissertation Abstract:

Book reviews:

Living Fabric, by Monisha Ahmed

Called from Obscurity, by Louis Fader

Himalayan Headstones, by Eileen Hewson

Bray's Bibliography Update no. 14

Notes on Contributors

Production: Bristol University Print Services.

Support: Dept of Ethnography and Social Anthropology, University of Aarhus.

EDITORIAL

After considerable unforeseen delays, *Ladakh Studies* vol. 18 is finally ready. My own absence from my home base during the summer—to attend the 11th colloquium of the IALS at Leh, among other things—slowed down the production process considerably.

While the issue was being completed, the sad news reached us of the passing away of our patron, Kushok Bakula Rinpoche. In this issue, we bring only a short report on his death. We plan to carry a series of more in-depth discussions about Kushok Bakula Rinpoche and his significance for Ladakh in the next issue.

At the eleventh colloquium, my editorship was extended with another two-year period, to expire in 2005. I thank members for their support and encouragement. However, in addition to the growing challenge of finding time for myself to compile, edit and produce *Ladakh Studies*, keeping a steady flow of publications depends primarily on whether or not we receive input from members. Although our membership now exceeds 200 people around the world, and although attendance at the 11th colloquium in Leh was at close to an all-time high, few potential contributions are submitted to *LS*. Short research reports, more substantial articles, contributions for discussion, thesis abstracts and book reviews, in addition to Bray's bibliography updates, are presumably very useful to all of us. Therefore, as always, I would like to encourage members to keep us in mind.

Quite specifically, I would be grateful if a member could take upon her- or himself to feed news items to me. I am no longer in a position to monitor newspapers very regularly myself, as new administrative responsibilities take up more of my day. Moreover, Heinz Räther, on whose contributions I could rely for quite some time, is no longer able to provide that service. If anyone – perhaps a few people – would be willing and able to monitor at least some of the main Indian newspapers on the web, that would be extremely useful. The new Google "news service" (news.google.com) makes monitoring news quite a lot easier, but I really could use some help here.

I would once again like to thank contributors to this issue, particularly John Bray, Martin Mills, Janet Rizvi, Pusp Saraf and Tashi Morup for their efforts.

FROM THE HONORARY SECRETARY

As this edition of Ladakh Studies was going to press, we learnt of the death of our Patron, Kushok Bakula Rinpoche. Kushok Bakula was the most prominent Ladakhi religious and political figure of his generation. He made a major contribution not only to India, but also to Mongolia where - besides serving as India's ambassador - he contributed to that country's post-communist Buddhist revival. Even at an advanced age, he continued to travel widely, including a visit to Japan earlier this year. We are greatly privileged that he was able to attend the inaugural session of the IALS's 11th conference in Leh in July. Though physically frail, he was evidently in good spirits. He will be greatly missed, not only in Ladakh but also much further afield.

Elsewhere in this issue, you will be able to read about the other events at the 11th colloquium in Leh. The colloquium was notable for the excellent mix of Ladakhi and international participants - a hopeful augury for the continuing health of our association in years to come.

Turning to the future, we have several important topics to think about:

- The biennial conferences are our most visible activity. Please read my report of a visit to Kargil to discuss the possibility of holding a conference there, and let me know what you think. At the same time, I would welcome offers to host an IALS conference elsewhere in either two or four years' time.
- I have also prepared a separate note on publications. The year 2004 should be a rich one for Ladakh conference papers as well as books and articles by individual authors. Shorter articles for Ladakh Studies would be particularly welcome.
- How can the IALS be more active between conferences? One possibility would be to hold shorter seminars or workshops with - say - two or three presentations by local and international members. Nawang Tsering Shakpo has offered to help host such meetings in Leh next summer. It would be good if we could hold one or more in Kargil. Please let me know what you think and what you can offer.
- The IALS's academic standards have been a topic for vigorous debate, both during and between conferences. We have included a summary of the issues in this edition of Ladakh Studies.
- Finally, we need to review the organisation and governance of the IALS. I hope to be able to draw up proposals on this topic in the first half of next year.

All that makes for a full agenda, and I look forward to active participation from across our varied membership.

NEWS FROM LADAKH

KUSHAK BAKULA IS NO MORE: THREE-DAY MOURNING IN J&K

He died as he had lived, peacefully

From Pushp Saraf

NEW DELHI, Nov 4: At a modest flat in 'J' Block in Saket lies the body of Kushak Bakula who was respectfully known as the Head Lama of Leh. He had breathed his last early this morning. Buddhist monks sit close to his mortal remains. They chant prayers in a low voice. As many more of them join, they take turns to pay homage to the saintly figure that had personified dignity as long as he had lived.

"He was to Ladakh what Dalai Lama is to Tibet, a king," says a monk loud enough for all to hear. Officials from the Prime Minister's office and the State Government drop in to offer condolences. A three-day State mourning has already been declared in Jammu and Kashmir. Leh will mourn for a much longer period. Perhaps it will always feel the absence of one of its most distinguished sons who was also its most revered religious and political face.

As the news of his death spreads, extensive police arrangements are made outside the flat early in the day. This indicates that a VIP movement is in the offing. Such inference is strengthened with inquiries from the PMO, Deputy Minister's Office, Defence Minister George Fernandes, External Affairs Minister Yashwant Sinha and J&K Chief Minister Mufti Mohammad Sayeed.

According to former aides of Kushak Bakula, there has been subsequently a re-think. As the VIPs' arrival would have created commotion in an already overcrowded neighbourhood, their plans to personally pay homage have been put off till Thursday when a function is scheduled to be held at J&K Government's local headquarters at Prithviraj Road. Clearly, after a security assessment, the police is withdrawn from outside the flat. The aides say that the Defence Minister has said that a special plane will take the body to Leh on Friday. That does not mean, however, that the final rites will be performed on the same day. That may take longer --- a week or more --- because there are many rituals to be performed before the last ceremony.

My friend and Chief Executive Councillor of Ladakh Autonomous Hill Development Council Thupstam Chhawang is badly shaken as he moves around in the flat. Son of Kushak Bakula's sister, he had flown to Leh early this morning after having spent more than a fortnight with his uncle. He had thought like everybody else that Kushak Bakula was recovering. It was only when he had landed in Leh that he learnt about the tragedy. He took the return flight to Delhi. The regular 9 a.m. news bulletin of the Leh radio station broke the news plunging the entire trans-Himalayan territory in sorrow and grief. Thupstam informs that only about a month ago Kushak Bakula's elder brother, a monk, had passed away in Manali. For him personally, it is a double tragedy.

Kushak Bakula had shown rare zest for life in his last days. When he was struck with pneumonia in July and admitted in a prestigious local hospital, there was a stream of visitors from Leh. Lama Lobzang, a former member of the National Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes Commission, was a regular visitor. Anyway he is based more in the national capital. Mr T. Samphel, president of the Ladakh Buddhist Association, Mr P. Namgyal, a former Union minister, and State Information Technology Minister Rigzin Jora, along with many others, had made it a point to regularly inquire about his health. Thupstam was in any case always around to do his duty both in a personal capacity and as the elected head of the Leh council.

Kushak Bakula had then surprised every one. He had recovered and taken off not for Leh but for Beijing and Mongolia to fulfill some commitments. Before he had fallen sick, he had visited Japan. I had last seen him at the inaugural function of the International Association of Ladakh Studies' colloquium in Leh. He came and was offered a seat on the dais in keeping with his status. The Mufti, who had inaugurated the colloquium, was surprised to see him there. He walked up to him and politely told him that he should not have strained himself. After some time, Kushak Bakula

was persuaded to occupy a more comfortable seat in the first row in the VIP enclosure among the audience.

He had always relished his visits to Mongolia in particular. He had been India's envoy in that country for ten years. This was after a long stint as the legislator, J&K minister, MP and a member of the National Minorities Commission. He had begun his career as a member of the State Constituent Assembly. It was not surprising, therefore, that the Mongolian Prime Minister, Mr N. Enkhbayar, was among the first to call to offer condolences on behalf of the Government and people of his country.

It was because Kushak Bakula was deputed in Mongolia, he was mostly out of Leh when the local Buddhist youths were up in arms against the State Government. Therefore, although a frequent visitor to Leh during that critical period, this scribe had the opportunity of holding extensive discussions with Kushak Bakula only once when he happened to be in Leh's Sankar monastery where he would always stay. Vijay Kranti, a friend and the well-known biographer of Dalai Lama, and I had discussed with him a wide range of subjects varying from his commendable influence over the Communists in Mongolia to the impact of Sindhudarshan over the local Buddhist culture. Much of what he had said was reported during those days. Suffice it to say, one was struck with his simplicity and transparency.

Since he would always speak in Ladakhi, his statements were invariably translated by his secretary Sonam Wangchuk, his closest aide for the last 25 years. "Only on Friday, the doctors had relieved him from the hospital. They had been pleasantly surprised by the improvement in his health and had said that as if a miracle had taken place. On his part, he had expressed the desire to go home. Perhaps he had known that the end was approaching", Sonam tells me.

Sonam recalls that Kushak Bakula had plenty of water last night and had gone to sleep at 2 a.m. this morning. At 6 a.m., he had inquired from his mentor whether he was feeling all right. Kushak Bakula had opened his eyes and then closed it as if saying yes. In an hour or so, it was all over. Sonam breaks down as he recalls his last meeting with the man whose shadow he had been for the quarter of a century.

In the flat in Saket, he is one of the few who are crying. The majority of the visitors so far have been monks. They maintain stoic silence. For them perhaps the mysteries of life and death are perhaps too well known to hold any awe or fear. In their company, Sonam just happens to be a lesser mortal. Like the most of us.

CHURCH INAUGURATED AT LEH

History was made when a new Roman Catholic Church was inaugurated at Leh, Ladakh, an aspiring of Roman Catholics fulfilled after two centuries from the time the jesuit priests from Portugal first visited Ladakh.

The solemn ceremony of blessing and consecration of the church christened after the Apostle of India, St Thomas was done at the hands of His Grace Lorenzo Baldiserri, the Apostolic Nuncio to India, who had specially flown down to Rome. The function was well attended by people of all faiths and the local flavour of Ladakh was added to a small celebration that included Ladakhi dances, priests, nuns and the laity from as far as Jammu, Chandigarh and Jalandhar travelled all the way to grace the occasion.

His Eminence Mar Varkey Cardinal Vithayathil, Major Archbishop of Syro-Malabar Church, while speaking on the occasion, stressed on the need for religious harmony and peace. He felt confident that the spiritual needs of several Christen soldiers posted in Leh would be met.

The Church, he noted, was a landmark in spreading the love and compassion of Christ. Mr Thupstang Chhewang, CEC, LAHDC, echoed the same sentiment and promised all help the small community needed. It was largess of the LAHDC that was responsible for the grant of land free of

cost to Church as a gift from the people of Ladakh. Bishop Peter Celestine, Bishop of Srinagar and Jammu is the mastermind behind the project which was completed in a record time of two working seasons against the projected date of September 2005.

LUTF ALL SET TO AGITATION FOR UT STATUS FOR LADAKH

By Tashi Morup

Leh, Sep 23: The Ladakh Union Territory Front (LUTF) is all set to begin its full-fledged agitation for UT status together with the local Muslims, who gave their decision to join the struggle recently. And in order to inform and acquaint about the struggle LUTF called a meeting at Khangri Hotel in Leh today, which was attended by both Muslim and Buddhist leaders besides village Sarpanches and Panches. The leaders in their addresses expressed the need to show solidarity for this political struggle. And as per the LUTF decision the first major joint rally will be held on September 30 in Leh. However, leaders in Kargil are still silent on the matter, said LBA President Tsering Samphel in his address. But their silence means 'support' in a way, he added while describing the demand for UT status to Ladakh 'constitutional'.

Speaking on the occasion Ghulam Hassan, Co-chairman, Ladakh Muslim Coordination Committee, said, after several deliberations among themselves Muslims have decided to join in the struggle for the UT demand. The Leh based Ladakh Muslim Coordination Committee had supported the majority opinion of offering support to the joint front with the motive of preventing "unnecessary division among Ladakhis". However, it had reserved its opinion on the demand of the UT status for Ladakh.

Ghulam Hassan also expressed that Muslims have decided to support the UT demand with the hope that they would get fair share and justice in Union Territory of Ladakh. He also clarified that there were certain apprehensions against UT status, which kept Muslims away from participating in the LBA organised rallies earlier. LBA banner was not an issue, he added while stating that we may remove our support in case things go against their community. Thus, he felt the need to have one mind to support LUTF for which they too have made some sacrifices in the form of rejecting the alleged luring promises of ministerial berths.

Later Geylong Lobzang Wangchuk, President Gompa Association alerted against the possible attempts to destabilize LUTF by such offerings as MLC seat with the promise of Ministerial berth in the State Assembly. Earlier he said, LBA under Tsering Samphel has had always this intention to involve Muslims also in the agitation for UT by giving it a political platform. And with this once again the demand for direct Central Administration has taken the center stage of the local politics in Ladakh. It may be recalled that the elections for the two assembly seats of Leh district went uncontested in favour of independent candidates representing LUTF much before the actual voting began in Assembly elections.

This indomitable political upsurge arose after Ladakh Buddhist Association (LBA) called a meeting at Leh Chokhang Vihara on August 25 in which all the Buddhist members of different local political parties including the Congress, the National Conference and the BJP besides host of other Buddhist leaders were present. The following day in a meeting local Muslims were told about the development and asked to give their opinion on the stand. It took two days for the Muslims before they sent a letter, which read: "The Leh based Ladakh Muslim Coordination Committee has supported the majority opinion of offering support to the joint front with the motive of preventing "unnecessary division Ladakhis". However, it has reserved its opinion on the demand of the UT status for Ladakh".

Speaking on the occasion Pintoo Narboo, elected MLA, defying the misnomer of calling UT demand as communal, said, UT status for Ladakh is a regional matter not communal. He said, the

invariably discriminative approach by the successive governments in J&K State towards Ladakh has led several delegations from Ladakh from time to time reaching Delhi with the demands such as Regional Autonomy, UT, Central Administration, ST etc. And it was high time to take up the struggle for Central Administration for Ladakh again when the whole international focus is on the Kashmir issue, which has become an international concern.

The demand for the Central Administration was raised shortly after the state's accession to India. The first ever deputation from Ladakh headed by Chhewang Rigzin Kalon, President Youngmen Association of Ladakh called on Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, the then Prime Minister of India, on May 4, 1949 and presented a Memorandum to him which pleaded that Ladakh should not be bound by the decision of any plebiscite that might be held to decide Kashmir's accession. Kalon had demanded their separation from Kashmir and closer integration with India. Just two weeks later another delegation led by Kushok Bakula, Head Lama of Ladakh, called on the Prime Minister of India. Kushok Bakula not only protested against Kashmir dominated administration but also challenged legality of the State Government's jurisdiction over the Ladakh region.

ANNUAL NATI-ADAB OF BALTI LANGUAGE RELEASED

KARGIL, Sept 29: Annual Nati-Adab of Balti language was released today by Mr Balwant Thakur, Secretary, J&K Academy of Art, Culture and Languages at the auditorium hall, here. Mr Ashok Parmar, District Development Commissioner, Kargil, was chief guest on the occasion. Mr Parmar assured all the possible help from the district administration for the development of local language and preservation of the ethnic culture of the area.

Earlier, welcoming the guests, Mr Mipam Otsal, Cultural Officer, Kargil said that with the help and cooperation of the artists and writers of Kargil, the Academy is going to start a new era of language and cultural development of Kargil. Those who spoke on behalf of the writers and artists of Kargil included Bashir Ahmed Wafa, Tsewang Rigzin and Abdul Hamid Tanveer.

A cultural function was also held on the occasion which included the performances of Balti songs and Purgi music and dance. Prominent among those who attended the function included Tsewang Namgial, Syeed Hussain Al-Mosvi, Haji Sana Ullah, Haji Ahmad Hussain Moroli, Ali Khan Hazin, Akhon Safdar Ali, Ahmad Jawan, Asgar Ali Basharat, Syeed Hadi, Phuntsog, Dy.SP, Qadir Giri, Sardar Avtar Singh and others.

ABIDI ELEVATED AS EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR

LEH, Oct 10: Mr Ghulam Abas Abidi, Councillor Ladakah Autonomous Hill Development Council was today elevated as Executive Councillor to look after the Health, Tourism and Protocol, Cooperatives, Wildlife, Fisheries, Parks and Gardens, Food and Supplies, District Motor Garages, Social Welfare and Minority Affairs.

The Chief Executive Councillor, Mr Thupstan Chhewang issued order today in pursuance of powers vested in him under Ladakah Autonomous Hill Development Council Act 1995. Mr Abidi was nominated as Councillor to the LAHDC in 2001.

PEOPLE OF KARGIL WILL OPPOSE TRIFURCATION: IKT

SRINAGAR, Oct 29: The people of the border district of Kargil in Ladakh region will oppose any move to divide Jammu and Kashmir on communal lines, a senior leader of the Imam Khomani Trust (IKT) of Kargil has said.

"We will fight against any move of granting Union Territory status to Ladakh region as demanded by the recently formed Ladakh Union Territory Front (LUTF)", IKT general secretary Asgar Karbalyee said. This is just a demand on communal lines, Mr Karbalyee said. "The people of the Muslim majority Jammu and Kashmir joined secular India at the time of partition. How can we allow the division of the State now on communal lines", he said adding Jammu and Kashmir will remain one.

The LUTF played an important role in getting two independents Sonam Wangchok Nurboo (Nobra) and Nawang Rigzin(Leh) elected unopposed after the senior leaders of all regional and national political parties resigned from their respective parties and joined the LUTF. The LUTF has been demanding Union Territory status to the entire Ladakh region—Leh and Kargil districts.

Mr Karbalyee said "we will not allow trifurcation of the State at any cost," but demanded due representation of the Ladakh region in the proposed coalition ministry and coordination committee. "We welcome the announcement made in the Common Minimum Programme (CMP) that Kargil district will also be granted an autonomous hill development council," he said. This step would definitely help in the overall development of the Kargil district, he said. He also demanded due representation of Ladakh region in the ministry. "I felt very bad when there was no representative from the Ladakh region present during the release of CMP by Mr Sayeed at New Delhi," he said. "We have extended our support to the coalition Government and it was the duty of the Congress and the PDP to give due representation to all the three regions of the State," he said.

The Zaskar seat was retained by Mohammad Abbas for the National Conference while the Kargil seat was won by independent Haji Nissar Ali backed by the IKT and others. Mr Karbalyee said "our one independent candidate has extended his support to the Congress-PDP coalition Government". Mr Karbalyee said "besides granting AHDC to Kargil, we demand an economic package for the area, which remained backward even after 55 years of independence". He said because the previous National Conference (NC) Government failed to address the problems of the people of the area, they were defeated in the region. Against three seats in the previous Assembly they (NC) had just one member from this Himalayan region, he said.

Mr Karbalyee who headed the election campaigning of Haji Nissar said the people of the region, which remains cut off for six winter months from the rest of the world, have great expectation with the new coalition Government. "Our demand for diesel generator power sets, particularly during the winter months was turned down by the previous Government while the Leh district was given six such generator sets of 750 kw each. We are not against Leh, but at least the people of Kargil should not be ignored," he said. "Our area has the vast potential of hydro power, which needs to be tapped to meet the demand of the entire region," he observed. He, however was critical of sanctioning Rs 260 crore for a tunnel, which will connect Leh with Himachal Pradesh. "It was unfortunate that the package was sanctioned for the Jammu and Kashmir, but will be spent in Himachal Pradesh," he said. Mr Karbalyee also pointed out that the entire Kargil district has only one college, which is yet to get affiliation from the Kashmir University. Moreover, the college has not been receiving funds from the University Grants Commission since it has not been granted affiliation by the Kashmir University, he said. He complained that the health care system in the district was very poor as compared to other districts of the State, and demanded that a sub-office of the School Board of Education should be opened in the region to conduct board examinations. (UNI)

LUTF SUPPORT TO COALITION GOVT CONDITIONAL: RIGZIN

By Sanjeev Pargal

JAMMU, Nov 3: Ladakh Union Territory Front (LUTF) leader and Minister of State for Public Works Department (PWD) Nawang Rigzin said today that the support of two LUTF MLAs to Mufti Sayeed led coalition Government was 'conditional'. "Our support to the new State Government was

based on three conditions – to strengthen the Leh Autonomous Hill Development Council (LAHDC), to look into reasons behind the demand for Union Territory (UT) status in Ladakh and ensure equitable development of Ladakh region", Rigzin told EXCELSIOR in an exclusive and first interview after taking oath as a Minister of State yesterday. "And if the Government didn't do that (fulfill out charter of just three demands), we wouldn't hesitate even for a minute to withdraw our crucial support to the Government", he warned.

It may be recalled that all political parties in Ladakh including National Conference, Congress (I) and BJP had wound up their parties and formed LUTF on the eve of Assembly elections in the State. Two Ministers in the NC Government and a member of Rajya Sabha had also resigned to join the Front. Later, two candidates – Nawang Rigzin and Sonam Wangchok Norboo – nominated by the LUTF from Leh and Nubra constituencies had been elected unopposed to the Assembly.

Nawang Rigzin explained that the LUTF changed its previous stand of staying neutral and extended support to PDP-Congress (I) coalition Government after observing that leadership of the two parties were making a 'sincere and honest effort' to solve 'immediate problems' of all three regions. "Appointment of a Jammu leader (Mangat Ram Sharma) as Deputy Chief Minister of the State and induction of a Minister each from Leh and Kargil in the first Ministry itself was a significant decision", he pointed out.

Declaring that LUTF still stands for the grant of UT status to Ladakh, Rigzin, however, said that this demand was part of a long term strategy adopted by the Front. "As and when a 'lasting and honourable solution' to the Kashmir problem is reached, we are bound to get the UT status", he averred. According to him, Jammu and Kashmir regions should be made two separate States with a quantum of autonomy to later while Ladakh should be made a Union Territory. "This could be the most practical and lasting solution to the problems of all three regions of the State", Rigzin said but clarified that he was not speaking language of the Vishwa Hindu Parishad (VHP) or the Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh (RSS).

However, he hastened to add that the demand of Union Territory status could take sometime to fulfill. "The demand was not going to be met in just one or two years but could be linked to a permanent solution to Kashmir problem". Under 'short term plan', the LUTF wants alienation among the people of all three regions to end, he said, adding "the Government should ensure equitable development opportunities in all three regions and address genuine grievances of the people".

Blasting the National Conference, Rigzin said the erstwhile ruling party did all but short of strangulating the Ladakhis physically during its 55 years rule in the State particularly during its last six years of governance. "It (the National Conference) made all efforts to sabotage the working of LAHDC by rendering it ineffective but it had to bow before pressure of the Ladakhis", he asserted but expressed satisfaction that "people of Ladakh saw through game of the NC and gave 21 out of 25 seats in LAHDC to us".

Saying that a number of powers had been vested with the LAHDC when it was established under a Union Home Ministry decision in 1994, Nawang lamented that the outgoing National Conference Government didn't make the necessary rules to implement these powers. Instead, he regretted, the Government tried to erode the LAHDC's sanctity by making attempts to curtail its powers. "NC Government's 'wrong doings' were one among the several reasons which prompting the Ladakhis to float LUTF", he said.

LAHDC CHAIRMAN RESIGNS

JAMMU, Nov 7: Chairman of Leh Autonomous Hill Development Council Thupstan Chhewang today said he has resigned from the post as he wanted to devote more time to strengthen the newly formed Ladakh Union Territory Front which has bagged two seats in the Jammu and Kashmir Assembly, to pursue Union Territory status for Leh.

"I have sent my resignation to the Chief Executive Councillor of Leh yesterday for being forwarded to the Chief Minister and the Chief Secretary of the State Government", Chhewang said on phone from Leh. He was critical of the Mufti Mohammad Sayeed led coalition Government for including one of the two front MLAs, who were elected unopposed to the State Assembly, as a Minister of State. By denying a cabinet berth, LUTF has been sidelined in decision making, he said and added that the front had decided to back the present Government after Pradesh Congress president Ghulam Nabi Azad indicated he would support our demand. Chhewang said he would hold talks with Chief Minister Mufti Mohammad Sayeed and Azad in Jammu on Saturday.

MUFTI REJECTS LAHDC CHAIRMAN RESIGNATION

Anil Bhatt

Jammu, Nov 07: In the yet another development in connection with LAHDC chairman's resignation, chief minister, Mufti Muhammad Sayeed, has reportedly not accepted his resignation so far, highly placed sources said here today. The job to motivate LAHDC chairman, Thupstan Chhewang, has been given to junior minister from Leh, Rigzin. He has been asked to motivate Chhewang to withdraw his resignation, sources told Greater Kashmir. The chairman of Leh Autonomous Hill Development Council, Chhewang had resigned from the post in protest against failure to take only one MOS in PDP-led coalition government instead of three taken in NC government earlier. Talking to GK from Leh, Chhewang said he would devote more time to strengthen the newly formed Ladakh Union Territory Front, which bagged two seats in the assembly elections, to pursue union territory status for Ladakh. "I have sent my resignation to the chief minister last evening as well as chief secretary", he said. He was critical of Mufti Sayeed-led coalition government for not accommodating our MLAs as per promise made to us. By denying a cabinet berth, LUTF has been sidelined in decision making, he said and added that he would hold talks with CM and JKPC chief, Gulam Nabi Aazd on Saturday in this direction.

GOVT TO REVIEW RULES FOR LADAKH COUNCIL

Jammu, November 10. A meeting was held between representatives of the state government and the Ladakh Autonomous Hill Development Council (LAHDC) here today. The meeting was chaired by the Finance, Law and Parliamentary Affairs Minister, Mr Muzaffar Hussain Beig, and attended among others by the Chief Secretary, Mr I.S. Malhi, Chairman, LAHDC, Mr Topstan Chhewang and Minister of State for Works, Mr Nawang Rigzin. The meeting, which discussed various administrative, developmental and legal issues was a sequel to the discussions which the delegation had with the Chief Minister Mufti Mohammad Sayeed last evening where proposals were discussed for accelerating the pace of development in Ladakh. It was decided to undertake a comprehensive exercise to review the rules and regulations and frame new rules or incorporate amendments wherever necessary as per time-bound programme to ensure the LAHDC had the necessary powers, the delegation of authority and the administrative wherewithal to meet the legitimate aspirations of the people.

The main issues discussed in the meeting today included legal framework of the LAHDC, administrative relationship between the LAHDC and the state government and tourism and economic development plan for Ladakh. The Finance Minister gave full assurance to the delegation that their legitimate demands and the release of funds within the capacity and jurisdiction of the government would be ensured earnestly. He said the Chief Minister was determined to provide all necessary support for accelerated development of the Ladakh region. He said the government would make every effort to ensure full cooperation and support to the LAHDC for the promotion of various projects

of tourism and for adequate empowerment of the council. Mr Beig said the government would seek adequate funds under the special economic package from the Centre for the development of tourism and other critical infrastructure in the region.

LAMA ZOTPA ASKS LADAKHIS TO SHUN CASTE PRACTICES

By Tashi Morup

LEH, Nov 19: Newly appointed Vice Chairman of National Commission for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, Lama Chospel Zotpa during his extended tour of Ladakh recently asked people to reject the practice of caste system prevalent especially among the Buddhist community. This he told addressing a group of students at SECMOL (a non-governmental organization) a day before he left for Delhi on Friday after his thorough surveillance of different places including Leh, Zaskar, Nubra and also in some parts of Himachal Pradesh. The Director SC/ST Commission, Stanzin Wangyal, accompanied him in his nearly a month-long visit to these places. At SECMOL a student from Domkhar village said that in his village a low caste family is facing social ostracism for 15 years. To this the Director Wangyal said that the least penalty of six-month non-bailable jail term against such practice as per the present Act has however, missed the case of Scheduled Tribe community practicing untouchability. Nevertheless, the Commission will soon launch a campaign to educate people about illegality of such practice, which also seriously violates the principles of Buddhism, said Lama Zotpa. But to put an immediate ban on such practice in Ladakh would not be wise, he said, adding that their effort to eliminate this social disease will be rather step-by-step. And to begin with they will bring out pamphlets in Ladakhi, English and Urdu languages.

Lama Zotpa also emphasized the importance of Bodyig script and language, which is the mother tongue of Ladakhis. He lamented the negligence of this language widely spoken in Himalayan regions while as the Dogri language has been recently included in the 8th schedule of Indian Constitution. He has already decided to send voluntary teachers to 75 schools in Spiti of Himachal Pradesh in order to improve upon the Bodyig language. And a similar plan for Ladakh is on the card though the J&K's Article 370 restricts the options available in Ladakh. Lama Zotpa also mentioned about a special education program for entire Tribal people to be launched soon. This he said while describing some of the disadvantages of very area-specific textbooks at primary level as suggested by Sonam Wangchuk, Director of SECMOL. Otherwise, he praised the efforts made by SECMOL in improving the education standard in Ladakh.

During his visits Lama Zotpa also vehemently spoke against the customary use of chang (local intoxicant) or alcohol in marriages and other social ceremonies in Ladakh. He said it is not important to continue such destructive customs of using chang. Nevertheless he stressed upon the need to preserve the rich traditional values and heritage inherited from forefathers. Lama Zotpa said, the large number of tourists from all over the world come here to see the cultural heritage including Gompas.

Reiterating the importance to learn Bodyig script and language while getting the modern education Lama Zotpa said in today's time it is essential to have both the knowledge without which it would be like a bird with its wings clipped. Lama Zotpa has led an association called Himalayan Action on Tibet prior to becoming Vice Chairman of the National Commission on SC and ST following the termination of Lama Lobzang as the member of Commission.

ENCOURAGING YIELD OF PASHMINA, WOOL IN CHANG-THANG

Neuma (Leh), Nov 18: The annual mutton and pashmina wool production in Chagthang Sub-division of Leh district has touched 7.58 lakh kgs and 30,000 Kgs respectively. The annual income by virtue

of pashmina in the Sub-division has risen to crores. Meanwhile, effective measures have been taken up by the Sheep Development department to boost the sheep population by utilizing all available resources of the area.

SAKA FESTIVAL INAUGURATED

LAHDC decides to improve primary education system

LEH, Apr 15: In order to give a fillip to the Ladakhi culture and to attract more tourists to Ladakh, the Tourism Department Leh organised Saka (ploughing) Festival in Leh on April 13 for three days. This is for the first time that Saka Festival is celebrated here. The glimpses of Ladakhi ploughing system were displayed by the artists by engaging Yaks in ploughing activity. The former Central Minister for Parliamentary Affairs, Mr Parmood Mahajan was the chief guest on the occasion. Mr Mahajan appreciated the attempts of the Tourism Department in preserving the ancient cultural antiquities which are the effective values in making unity in Indian polity. He urged upon the people to preserve and promote one's culture besides giving attention in modern technologies. The executive councilor Tourism, Mr Ghulam Abaas Abidi, who presided the inaugural function, said that as much as 7000 tourists have visited Ladakh last year and he expects that more tourists this year due to Sindhu Darshan Festival, Ladakh Festival and Saka Festival.

Meanwhile, the Ladakh Autonomous Hill Development Council (LAHDC) has decided to go for improved primary education in order to achieve the target of 70 percent result in matric board examinations by 2007 from the present 35 percent pass in the Government schools. The decision came forth after a two day seminar prior to the weeklong campaign under the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) and Operation New Hope (ONH). In the seminar attended by all the Panchayat and Village Education Committee (VEC) members and councillors, LAHDC decided to run this collaborated campaign based on a 10 point programme on ways to improve primary education including a monitoring system. During the campaign, Thupstan Chhewang in his address made a different villages including Tarchit, Kharpu, Himya, Tugla, Phulak, Ligtse in his Kungyam constituency sensitised the parents of their role in improving the primary level education of their children. At a function at High School Likte, he said that the primary level of education in the district is not so sound in comparison to development registered in road connectivity, non-functional buildings etc in Leh. He said that the Hill Council focussed on making a sound basic education facility so to curb the drop out rates and more students could pass the matriculation examination.

HEAVY PAK SHELLING IN KARGIL: One killed, 6 injured

KT NEWS SERVICE

SRINAGAR. Apr 17: Pakistani army resorted to unprecedented shelling in Kargil sector targeting vital installations schools, college and residential houses in main Kargil town. One civilian was killed while as six others including four school children were injured in the cross border shelling.

Police said Pakistani regulars targeted the micro hydel project and government degree college, two schools and a residential area in Kargil town when they fired number of artillery and mortar shells towards them. Some shells landed near Pioneer public school and Mazhar public school killing peon of a school Mohammed Abdullah on the spot. Four school children were injured. They have been identified as Buhran-ud-din, Riyaz Ahmad, Ghulam Abbaas and Mohommad Ibrahim. Two laborers were injured when Pakistani army shelled the Micro Hydel Power Project in Kargil. Pakistani army also targeted Government Degree College Kargil causing extensive damages to the complex. Four houses received extensive damages due to cross border shelling.

The cross border shelling created panic in the town. People ran helter skelter for safety. Such was the panic among the populace that shopkeepers closed down their shops and took shelter in the underground bunkers. Meanwhile Pakistani troops have also resorted to massive shelling in different

sectors along the line of control in Kashmir. Reports pouring in said Pakistani troops fired number of shells in Tangdhar and Karanah sectors. Troops gave a matching response to the cross border shelling.

KARGIL TO HAVE A HILL DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL N JUNE

JAMMU, Apr 24: Kargil is poised to take a historic step by setting up a Hill Development Council for "local Governance apparatus" in June this year. "The work has now begun in the direction of setting up of a local Governance Apparatus popularly known as Kargil Autonomous Hill Development Council (KAHDC), to fulfill aspirations of Kargil people," Minister for Youth Service, Sports and Technical Education, Haji Nisar Ali said here today. Autonomous Hill Development Council was a "New Year Gift" to the people of Kargil by the PDP-led coalition Government in order to end neglect and underdevelopment of the rocky belt by successive Governments in the State, Ali, who represents Kargil, said. There would be a 30-member committee in KAHDC from different areas of Kargil district, he said and added that 26 of them would be elected, for which process has already begun.

With a geographical area of 14036 square KM, Kargil has just 1.17 lakh population, smallest of 14 districts in J&K. "Of 30 members, who would be called Councillors and Executive Councillors, four will be nominated members," Ali said and added while one seat would be represented by principal minority community, another by women and two recommended by the State Government. The State Government announced setting up of Autonomous Development Council on the pattern of Leh Autonomous Hill Development Council (LAHDC) on December 23, when the Government also empowered LAHDC, he said. (PTI)

ZANASKAR PEOPLE DEMAND 10 SEATS IN PROPOSED KHDC

JAMMU, May 18: Blaming the State Government, for total discrimination with Zanaskar Sub Division, the Zanaskar Action Committee (ZAC), today, demanded that ten seats be earmarked for this remote and hilly area in the proposed Autonomous Hill Development Council of Kargil.

Talking to mediapersons, here, this morning, T Chhosphe, secretary, of the Committee and T Paldan representative of the Sarpanches from Zanaskar, criticized the Government for giving three seats to the Sub Division in the proposed Council.

They said, such a proposal was not acceptable to the 15,000 inhabitants of Zanaskar Sub Division which has a majority population of Bhudists. Such a proposal is a discrimination with the area which has already been neglected by the Government in other spheres of development, they alleged.

The ZAC leaders alleged that the Zanaskar area sans basic facilities and the condition of primary Health Centre, schools and roads in the area is worst, as no attention has been paid by the administration for the proper utilization of Government money.

The medicare facilities are not available, as the Primary Health Centre at Zanaskar faces the dearth of staff, said Mr Chhosphe, adding this has worst added to the problems of the people. He said, often during the delivery cases patients die in the way while reaching the Sub District Hospital, Kargil which is 230 kilometers away from the area.

Making a dig at Government for its dismal performance on developmental front, he said, the three canals the construction of which was started way back in 1980 are still incomplete and no attention has been paid to water supply in the area. "For us there is no shift in Government policies with the change of Government", he added.

Besides the Zanaskar, Kargil road is totally in dilapidated condition and no attention is being paid for its repair or renovation he alleged. "The area also sans the proper transport facilities and people have to go from Zanaskar to Kargil on foot, he added."

He said, the Committee had already given a memorandum to Chief Minister, Mufti Mohammed Sayeed, Deputy CM, Mr Mangat Ram Sharma and Law and Parliamentary Minister, Mr Muzzafar Baig but till date no action has been taken to redress the grievances of the people of this remote and backward area.

BY-POLL IN LAHDC PEACEFUL

KT NEWS SERVICE

Leh, May 17: The polling for the three seats lying vacant for sometime in the Ladakh Autonomous Hill Development Council (LAHDC) went peacefully, however, vote-cast percentages differed from one polling station to another with the highest of 83 percent recorded at Skyanos polling station in the Lower Leh constituency today.

The Housing Colony area, which was declared super-sensitive zone, recorded as low as 23 percent at one of its polling stations. At the Basgo Councillor's constituency, which was earlier represented by the State Cabinet Minister, Nawang Rigzin Jora, the polling station at Nyemo recorded the highest of 82 percent followed by Basgo 54 and Umla 47 until the last information received. The ballot boxes was yet to arrive from Khaltse constituency, which has veterans Nurboo Gyalton and Tsering Nurboo Lampa as the opponents with apple and aeroplane as their respective symbols.

The counting of votes will happen on Monday until then the ballot boxes have been kept in the strong room at newly built Leh Indoor Stadium unlike Govt. Middle School buildings before. Total of seven candidates contested from the three different constituencies. The two constituency seats were vacated by Tashi Angdu, who resigned from the lower Leh Councillor's post and Nawang Rigzin Jora, Minister for Science and Technology, Employment and Labour, Jammu and Kashmir State, who was the councillor from Basgo constituency before he was elected as the MLA from Leh uncontested. The third constituency is Khaltse, which was one of the two places from where Chairman LAHDC Thupstan Chhewang won the Councillor's seat, while first being Kungyam. Tundup Tsering (Tutun) with his main rival candidate Dorje Mutup were in the fray for the Lower Leh constituency seat while the third candidate Ahmatullah Azad also decided to fight for this councillor's post.

With, although, just about three years to go for the second LAHDC term this mid-term election after the formation of Ladakh Union Territory Front (LUTF) disbanding the various political parties is expected to bring out interesting results. The second LAHDC elections were held in the year 2000 when 74 candidates contested for 26 seats with 68000 voters.

NC MAKES GAINS IN KARGIL

Jammu Aug. 16. The National Conference has made a comeback in the elections to the Kargil Autonomous Hill Development Council giving its senior leaders a reason to smile.

A small event in the bigger landscape of Jammu and Kashmir, elections to the Council were held in the second week of July. It acquired importance as it tested the strength of the Congress in the border district, scene of the infamous Kargil conflict. Of the 26 seats to be filled, elections were held for 23 seats. In the three seats reserved for the Buddhist-dominated Zaskar sub-division there was a complete boycott. The Buddhists boycotted the elections after their demand for at least 10 seats was rejected.

At the first meeting of the Council on Thursday, 13 of the 23 councillors elected the NC leader and former Minister, Qamar Ali Akhoo, as the Chief Executive Councillor who would have an equivalent rank to a cabinet minister. The State Government formally constituted the Council just

before the elections last month drawing criticism from the NC for the long delay. The NC also accused the Government of trying its best not to let the NC nominee become Chief Executive Councillor. The Kargil council would now have the powers for sanctioning development works with a limit of Rs. five crores. Talking to The Hindu, Asghar Karbali, a senior leader, said, "the constitution of the Council should not be seen with a political eye. The main task for us would be to concentrate on the developmental side and we have evolved a consensus on this to make this border district an abode of prosperity".

VOHRA ARRIVES ON WEEKLONG LADAKH TRIP

Leh, Aug 3: The centre's interlocutor on Jammu and Kashmir, N. N. Vohra reached here today on a weeklong visit of Ladakh. He was received at the airport by the senior district officers including Deputy Commissioner, Tashi Dorje, Senior Superintendent of Police, Tsering Panchok and members of political parties and religious leaders including President, Moin-ul-Islam Mohammad Shafi Lasoo. This is his first visit of Ladakh. He has already visited Jammu and Srinagar and interacted with several delegations and individuals on finding solution to Jammu and Kashmir imbroglio.

Interacting with the senior district officers at Leh Circuit House, Vohra evinced keen interest in history and lifestyle of Ladakh, which is becoming a centre of tourist hub. The Deputy Commissioner gave him a detailed account of the topography and the developmental scenario in Leh district. He said the current year has remained a favourable year as far as the tourist industry is concerned. A record number of foreign as well as home tourists visited Leh. Leh received lesser number of tourists during last three years. Vohra showed keen interest in promotion of Leh berry, a product of seabuck thorn which is grown in large number in Leh's vicinity and Nobra valley. [. . .]

Vohra will be meeting the delegations from 4th August, delegation of Ladakh Autonomous Hill Development, Leh being the first. This will be followed by Ladakh Union Territory Front, political leaders, Ladakh Buddhist Association. On 5th, he is meeting with Anjuman-e-Imamia, Anjuman-e-Moin-ul-Islam, Moravian Christian Association and other religious leaders. He is also meeting Women Alliance Ladakh, Merchant Association and Ladakh Women's Centre and the press. The octogenarian religious and political leader Kushok Bakula is also meeting the centre's interlocutor. Vohra is visiting Kargil on August 7 for two days.

VOHRA MEETS LUTF REPRESENTATIVES IN LEH

By Tashi Morup

Leh, August 03: In the first phase of the series of meetings between the Central government representative with Jammu and Kashmir N N Vohra and the various leaders of the Leh district, the members of the Ladakh Union Territory Front (LUTF) reiterated the popular demand for the Union Territory (UT) status with legislative power for Ladakh region at the Leh Circuit House today.

'The main aim of the LUTF is to struggle and unite all people under one banner for achievement of the UT status for Ladakh,' stated a memorandum presented to Vohra, who arrived here on Sunday for his six-day visit to Leh and Kargil districts. The memorandum has further said, 'we also reiterate our stand that for any future settlement of the vexed Kashmir problem the people of the three regions of the state should be taken into confidence and the wishes and their aspirations respected for a lasting and peaceful resolution of the Kashmir problem within the framework of the Indian Constitution.'

The President LUTF, Tsering Dorjay, said, during the meeting, the Centre's representative was acquainted with the historical background of the UT demand for Ladakh and the formation of the

LUTF. They also talked about the need for the cultural preservation, besides the developmental issues of the district.

Earlier Vohra met the J&K Minister for Science and Technology, Nawang Rigzin Jora and the LAHDC Executive Councillors led by the Chairman, Thupstan Chhewang. The economic constraints and other developmental issues were the focus in the meeting between Vohra and the LAHDC. Thupstan Chhewang and the other Executive Councillors later joined the LUTF members to meet Vohra again. While hoping that Centre's effort would bring about some political solution to the Kashmir problem, Chhewang said to the media that there must be a solution to the Kashmir problem and in

this regard the popular demand of the UT status for Ladakh should be taken into account in order to alleviate the injustices against the people of Ladakh.

KARGIL COUNCIL FOR GREATER LADAKH

Srinagar: Opposing the demand for Union Territory status for Ladakh and the trifurcation of Jammu and Kashmir, the Kargil Autonomous Hill Development Council said the Ladakh Union Territory Front's (LUTF) demand for UT status was confined to Leh district only. The council has put forth the demand for a Greater Ladakh which would include Gilgit, Skardu and Baltistan. An Autonomous Hill Development Council delegation met Centre's interlocutor on J&K Mr NN Vohra on Thursday. The council said any solution to the Kashmir problem should be take into account the wishes of the people of all three regions of the state. Mr Vohra is on a week long visit to Leh and Kargil to meet representatives of various political, social and religious organisations. The delegation demanded that a special grant of Rs 35 crore from the Centre to set up infrastructure of the newly-constituted Kargil Autonomous Hill Development Council. The BJP delegation also met Mr Vohra and opposed any division of the state and also the demand for Union Territory status for Ladakh. Members said civil air services to Kargil should be started immediately and funds. The team demanded funds from the Centre for the construction of the Zojila tunnel. A 3-member National Conference delegation endorsed the demand for restoration of pre-1953 autonomy to the state. The team opposed any division of the state and the demand for Union Territory status for Ladakh. NC members suggested that talks be held with Pakistan to resolve the J&K problem and that the LoC be converted into an international border.

3 MW PROJECT TO BE COMMISSIONED NEXT YEAR

LEH, Sept 24: The Centre has given its technical sanction for setting up of Rs. 300 crore Alchi Hydel Project in Leh. The project estimated to generate 45 MW power is expected to be commissioned by 2008. This was stated by Deputy Chief Minister Mangat Ram Sharma during his visit to various power projects in Leh today. He said the State has already approached the Centre for providing funds for the project. Mr. Sharma is currently on a 4-day tour to Ladakh region. Mr. Sharma said that another 3 MW Igoo Hydel Project Martselang involving Rs. 34 crore would be commissioned next year. He said Rs. 23 crore have already been spent on the project so far.

Deputy Chief Minister also reviewed the present power situation in Ladakh at a high level meeting, which was among others attended by Minister for Works Mr. Madan Lal Sharma. The meeting also discussed the pace of progress on 3 MW Igoo-Phey power project, which is likely to be commissioned by next year. Addressing the meeting, Mr. Sharma stressed for accelerating the pace of work on the projects under execution in district to meet the growing demand of power in the area. He said Ladakh region has a good potential for hydel power projects and the need was to

harness this optimally. He said the coalition Government has taken up the stupendous task of tapping the hydro potential by involving private sectors. He said the PDD department has identified various streams and rivers in Ladakh areas including river Sindh, Shayok and other rivulets like Dha, Hanu, Dhomkher, Bogdang, Sasoma and Kumdok for setting up hydel projects. He said once these projects are taken up Ladakh would be surplus in power generation.

JUICING UP THE MARKET

Ladakh Foods is trying to change the landscape of the juices and jams market on the strength of vitamin-rich berry, says Jai Arjun Singh

What can a little-known berry, found in the icy heights of the Himalayas, do for the fruit juice market in India? Plenty, if the plans of Ladakh Foods Ltd. are translated into liquid reality.

Ladakh Foods is building a portfolio of products from fruit juices to jams and sauces, based on the little-known seabuckthorn berry, which grows in the Ladakh region. That may seem like a risky gamble. But Ladakh Foods doesn't think so. Two months ago it launched Leh Berry, its first fruit juice in Delhi and it's selling it in the more affluent parts of town. Since January the drink has also been on shopshelves in cities like Hyderabad, Nagpur and Pune.

D K Mittal, group chairman, Compact International, is putting big bets on seabuckthorn. Last year the group built a pulp processing factory in Leh. Ladakh Foods, part of the same group, handles the distribution.

Naturally, the juice will be competing with such established players as Tropicana and Real. The fruit juice market has been saturated, so to speak, by the preponderance of orange, mango and apple flavours, so Leh Berry believes it has the advantage of a fresh taste. But its competitive edge may well lie in its positioning. Ladakh Foods is marketing Leh Berry as a nutrition drink (it prefers not to use the word health, with its bitter, medicinal associations), based on the chronicled nutritional properties of the seabuckthorn fruit.

Legends about the nutritive and energy-giving properties of the berry date back to ancient Greece, according to the International Seabuckthorn Association. The association says that Mongol conqueror Genghis Khan used the fruit to improve the fitness and stamina of his armies. Closer to the present, Russian cosmonauts have used them in space to combat cosmic radiation and as an oxygen supplement. What makes the fruit special? Its supporters say the juice contains a potent mix of compounds and vitamins that help to fight a string of diseases.

The branded fruit juice market in India is estimated to be worth Rs 120 crore and the segment is growing at about 30 per cent per annum. The market leader is Dabur's Real Fruit (50 per cent to 55 per cent) followed by Pepsi's Tropicana. Both players are firmly established, so Ladakh Foods' target of capturing at least 7 per cent of the market share within a year and 20 per cent by 2006-end is ambitious. Ladakh Foods had a turnover last year of Rs 2 crore and it aims to boost that five times by 2004.

Can a one-flavour brand sustain itself in a competitive market? Mittal has the answer ready. "Seabuckthorn will always provide the base for our juices," he says, "but we will soon hit the market with new flavours mixed with seabuckthorn extract." The company is looking at conventional flavours like apple but the plan for the near future is to introduce apricot, passian (a fruit popular in the north east) and even pomegranate mixes. Currently, Leh Berry is available in 200 ml and 1,000 ml packs priced at Rs 12 and Rs 55 respectively. For now, the company is ready with its next product lines — jams and sauces made with seabuckthorn as the base. Jams, fine, but is India ready for a fruit sauce revolution? Mittal is optimistic. "It's a question of being open to a new concept. We believe the citric taste of the sauce will combine well with foods like paranthas."

The company doesn't want to divulge the prices yet, saying only that they will be similar to those of the competition — Kissan jam, for instance. The jam and sauce will also be available in sachets, priced at Rs 2 and Re 1 respectively. Further down the line is a foray into cosmetics, again with a

seabuckthorn base. Fairness creams, face packs and anti-aging creams will soon hit the market under the brand name Seabuck, and as many as 30 products are planned for the next six months. The company even says it is hoping to make a foray into pharmaceuticals based on seabuckthorn. This has a precedent: in Russia, for instance, purely medicinal use is made of the extract.

Compact International conducted research on the seabuckthorn fruit in association with Defence Research and Development Organisation (DRDO). Ladakh Foods Ltd was incorporated early last year with an investment of Rs 4.8 crore, its objective being to carry out business in the field of horticulture and food processing in Leh-Ladakh. An integrated processing plant was set up at Leh to process the fruit juice, and the company signed a joint venture with National Agricultural Cooperative Marketing Federation of India Ltd (NAFED) and Small Farmers' Agri-Business Consortium (SFAC). "Over 300 farmers invested in the company," says Mittal. This was followed by a tie-up with Godrej Industries Ltd for the use of its Bhopal plant for co-packaging. The fruit is seasonal — it can be plucked only in a six-week period between August and September — so NAFED has taken the responsibility for storage.

While seabuckthorn-based products are only just being produced for Indian markets, worldwide the fruit has long been used in juices and in medicine. Mittal, who recently attended an international Seabuckthorn conference, says China has as many as 180 products made from seabuckthorn. But he also points out that the fruit is being artificially produced in that country, something not yet done in India. "There is still plenty of potential for wider cultivation of the fruit," he says.

DAMAGE TO LADAKH ECOLOGY

Leh: Since the opening of Changthang to the tourists in 1994 the ecologically important region full of wetlands in the south-eastern part of Ladakh, adverse impacts of tourism and developmental activities have started taking their toll. In addition, the Tibetan refugees who have been given marshy lands for farming, are proving fatal with wetland ecosystem driving away several migratory and vulnerable species of birds. WWF-India has taken up a project-Conservation of High Altitude of Wetlands of Ladakh to develop a strategy and action plan through research, surveys and motivating all stake holders local communities, tour operators and defence forces. Tsomoriri, Tsokar and Pangong Tso-the largest three vulnerable wetlands of Ladakh- are being studied. The Tsomoriri lake has environmental significance as it is the prime habitat for breeding water fowl, including the globally threatened black-necked crane and the bar-headed goose. Tsoksar hosts many water birds, including one of the 13 pairs of black-necked crane recorded in Ladakh. The project is unique as it roped in and motivated all stakeholders to save the ecologically significant but vulnerable region at a height between 4,000 to 5,000 metres from sea level.

NEWS FROM MEMBERS

- *Smriti Srinivas* has accepted a position at the University of California at Davis. Her new e-mail address is: smriti_srinivas2002@yahoo.com.

CONFERENCE REPORT

11th IALS COLLOQUIUM Leh-Choglamsar 21-25 July 2003

The 11th IALS colloquium took place from 21-25 July in Leh and Choglamsar, and was co-hosted by the Jammu and Kashmir Academy of Art, Culture and Languages. The conference was a notable success, and we are grateful to the Academy — and especially to Balwant Thakur (Secretary of the Academy) and Nawang Tsering Shakspo (Cultural Officer, Leh) — for making it possible.

The conference benefited from wide publicity and high-level government support. The opening ceremony took place at the government auditorium, next to the polo ground in Leh, and the chief guest was Jammu & Kashmir Chief Minister Jenab Mufti Mohammad Sayeed. The government delegation included: Mangat Ram Sharma, J&K Deputy Chief Minister; Ngawang Rigzin Jora, J&K Minister for Science and Technology; and Thupstan Chhewang, the Chief Executive Councillor of the Ladakh Autonomous Hill Development Council. Distinguished guests at the opening ceremony included Skushog Bakula Rinpoche, the patron of the IALS. Ghulam Hassan Khan — Ladakh's member of parliament — attended one of the sessions.

The actual conference took place in Choglamsar at the Indus Hotel, which for five days became an international serai. As ever, we had a strong international mix, with participants from different regions of Ladakh and other parts of India, as well as Austria, Belgium France, Germany, Italy, the Netherlands, the UK and the US. Disappointingly, no participants from Baltistan were able to come: we hope that we will be able to make up for this at the next colloquium.

Before the conference, a Ladakhi friend had asked somewhat sceptically whether there was anything of international interest left in Ladakh: he evidently half-expected the answer 'No'. The papers proved otherwise. Altogether, there were more than 60 presentations. For the first time in IALS history, we had to have parallel sessions on the Tuesday and on the Friday afternoon.

One overriding theme that touched on almost all the sessions concerned social change and development: what are Ladakhis gaining and what are they losing? What choices are there? And who should be responsible for making them? Such questions came up even in less 'obvious' sessions. For example, in the opening panel on Art and Archaeology, Professor Wolfgang Heusgen from the Graz University of Technology discussed problems of architectural conservation at Alchi. There are now plans to construct a hydro-electric project some two to three kilometres up river from Alchi, and the tremors caused by explosives used in its construction threatens to undermine the stability of the temple buildings there. It is important to develop new sources of energy, but what is the right approach?

In the session on wildlife, Rinchen Wangchuk gave a hopeful paper on the possibilities for reconciling wildlife conservation with the demands of local villagers who wish to protect their livestock from snow leopards. Field investigations and discussions with the villagers showed that it was possible to reduce the number of domestic livestock casualties by building better corrals, thus encouraging the leopards to concentrate on other prey.

Several participants spoke from personal experience in the sessions on 'culture and traditions' and 'development and social change'. Abdul Ghani Sheikh presented a paper on transformation in Kuksho village, which has a mixed Buddhist and Muslim population. In a similar vein, Tsering Norboo discussed how the Wakha-Mulbekh region served as a 'confluence' of two faiths — Buddhism and Islam.

Sat Paul Sahni described how he had first visited Ladakh in 1946, and discussed the many changes that he had witnessed in his frequent visits since then. He supported his paper with an extensive slide show: the older pictures of familiar places such as Leh bazaar were particularly striking. Harjit Singh presented personal reminiscences of his first researches in Ladakh in what

now seem like the distant days of 1973: he underestimated the challenges of the Khardong-la, and emerged from his adventures thinner and wiser. Both these veterans were outmatched by an account of an even earlier visit to Ladakh, by Prince Peter of Greece and Denmark in 1938. Martijn van Beek presented a paper written by his colleague Poul Pedersen of Aarhus University. Poul has found papers, photographs and even a short film left by Prince Peter. We were able to see a video version of the film, showing a polo match, and a yak caravan arriving in the bazaar from Central Asia.

The importance of the Ladakhi language came up at several points in the conference. Muhammad Omar Gutu Nadvi, the Imam of the Jama Masjid in Leh, told of his collaborative initiative with Rev Konchok Phandey to translate the Holy Quran into simple Ladakhi. On the final day, Roland Bielmeier discussed the classification of Western Tibetan Dialects. Raja Iftikhar Hussain, who lives in Srinagar but whose family comes from Baltistan, discussed the impact of Balti dialect. Bettina Zeisler discussed the evolution of Ladakhi, and its relationship with classical Tibetan. Papers by Tashi Gyalpo and Konchok Rigzin prompted a vigorous — and appropriately multilingual — debate on the merits of learning classical Tibetan and the extent to which it was possible or desirable to develop a written form of colloquial Ladakhi.

In addition to the conference papers and slide presentations, we benefited from a cultural performance showing dance from all parts of Ladakh on 22 July. The following evening we returned to the polo-ground auditorium for an impressive performance of *Lta sam med pe 'rgyu rjai* by Mipham Otsal's Ladakh Theatre Organisation (LTO). The performance starred Otsal himself and, using mime and other techniques, again raised questions about 'blind development.' On the Thursday evening, we saw a presentation of an American film, *Oracles and Demons of Ladakh*, which — among other local celebrities — featured the Ayu Lhamo.

A short report such as this is bound to be partial and incomplete. For a more detailed record, it will be necessary to wait for the colloquium proceedings. We plan to publish a conference volume through the Cultural Academy (see separate note on IALS publications), and this should come out in the course of 2004.

News of the conference was broadcast locally both in the printed media and on television. On my final evening in Leh, I had the pleasure of watching a Doordarshan Urdu-language programme showing two IALS members — Abdul Ghani Sheikh and Janet Rizvi — reviewing the conference. They commented that Ladakh was a special place to attract such international interest. Indeed.



IALS 11, CONFERENCE PROGRAMME

MONDAY, 21 JULY

11:00 Opening Ceremony. Auditorium Hall, Pologround, Leh. Chief Guest: Jammu & Kashmir Chief Minister Jenab Mufti Mohammad Sayeed.

14:00 - 15:30 *Art And Archaeology* Chair: Dr John Crook
Harald Hauptmann: Rock Carvings and Inscriptions along the Upper Indus
Jamwal And Tashi Ldawa Tshangspa: Rock Carvings of Ladakh.

16:00 - 18:00 *Art And Archaeology*
Wolfgang Heusgen: Alchi Sumtsek: a Jewel Endangered
John Harrison: The Achi Assoc and the Conservation of the Kanji Tsug-Lag-Khang
Christian Luczanits: Alchi Monastery Reconsidered
Erberto Lo Bue: Traditional Buddhist Art in 20th Century Ladakh

TUESDAY, 22 JULY.

Parallel Session One

09:30 - 11:00 *Culture And Traditions* Chair: Kaneez Fatima
Ritesh Arya: Significance of Ground Water Exploration in Ladakh Himalaya
Corinne Wacker: Water Management in Takmachik Village
Abdul Hakim Skampari: Gur-Gur Tea: The Traditional Drink of Ladakh

11:30 - 13:00 *Culture And Traditions*
Sonam Phuntshog Achinathang: On Puriki Culture
Nawang Tashi: Cultural Heritage of Ladakh
Rigzin Angchuk: Cho Bagdarskyab

14:00 - 16:30 *Culture And Traditions* Chair: Dr Nawang Tsering
Morup Namgyal - Wanla Lonpo
Tsewang Dolma: Role of Ladakhi Women.
Abdul Ghani Sheikh: Transformation in Kuksho Village

Parallel Session Two

9:30 - 11:00 *Wildlife* Chair: Henry Osmaston
Jigmet Takpa: Wildlife of Ladakh/ Scope of Renewable Energy in Ladakh
Mohd Abbas: Wildlife of Ladakh
Rinchen: Snow Leopard Conservancy and Ecotourism in Markha

11:30 - 13:00: *Horticulture and Biology*
Mohd. Saleem Mir Bhimbhat: Apricot Wealth of Ladakh
Dr. O.P. Chaurasia And Dr. P. Gurmet: Ethnobotany of Ladakh

14:00 - 15:30: *Health*
Alessandro Boesi: Medicinal Plants
Dr. Jamila Bano: High Altitude Acute Mountain Sickness in Ladakh

16:00 - 18:00: *Amchi System Of Medicine*

Dr. S.T. Phuntsog: Dharmic Physiology
Amchi Tsering Phuntshog: Amchi Medicine and the Environment

Evening: Cultural Show

WEDNESDAY, 23 JULY

09:30 - 11:00 *Development and Social Change* Chair: Prof. Harjit Singh

Sat Paul Sahni: Change in Ladakh Since 1946
Tashi Morup: Distress Migration of Changpas
Gyurmet Dorje: Education vs. Economy of Ladakh

11:30 - 13:00 *Development And Social Change*

Gerhard Emmer: Condition of Argons in Ladakh
Pushp Saraf: Buddhist Political Activism after 1988
Gitanjali Chaturvedi: Trifurcation: a Secular Agenda?

14:00 - 15:30 *Development And Social Change* Chair: Salim Beg

Kaneez Fatima: Drass Valley. Cultural Educational: a Viewpoint
Dr. Padma Gurmet: Amchi System of Medicine

16:00 - 17:30: *Development And Social Change*

Sunandan Tiwari, Radhika Gupta: An Ethnography of Traditional Irrigation Patterns in Leh
Town
Sat Paul Sahni -- Slides on Changes in Ladakh since 1946.

19:00 Theatre Performance by Ladakh Theatre Organisation (LTO)

THURSDAY, 24 JULY

09:30 - 11:00 *Social Research* Chair: Janet Rizvi

Fernanda Pirie: Dancing in the Face of Death: Losar Celebrations in Photoksar
Harjit Singh: Fieldwork Experiences of a Research Scholar in Ladakh in 1973.
Dr. Nawang Tsering: Loss of Tibet and its Impact on Ladakh

11:30 - 13:00 History

Jigar Mohammed: Moghul Sources for the History of Ladakh
Skarma Junglay: Fokar: The Kingdom of Purig
Dr. Juergen Trebst: Douglas 1895

14:00 - 15:30 *History and Religion*

Poul Pedersen: Prince Peter's Visit to Ladakh in 1938 (and ten-minute film)
Muhammad Omar Gutu Nadvi: The Holy Quran and the Teachings of The Holy Prophet
Muhammad (PBUH) and the Ladakhi Language

16:00 - 17:00: Parallel Session 1: *History and Language*

Chair: Gelong Thubtan Paldan

Chimed Namgyal: On the Importance of Learning Ladakhi
Tsering Norboo (Ayu): Ladakhi Proverbs
Tashi Stobdan Lokskeya: Once Ladakh was a Lake

16:00 - 17:00: Parallel Session 2

Sanjai Dwivedi et al: Untapped Potential of Horticulture in Ladakh

Evening: Film Showing (Oracles and Demons of Ladakh)

FRIDAY, 25 JULY

09:00 - 11:00 *Law, Language and Linguistics*

Ghulam Murtaza: Ancient Legal System in Ladakh Region

Roland Bielmeier: On the Classification of Western Tibetan Dialects

Bettina Zeisler: On the Position of the Ladakhi and Balti Language Family

Raja Iftikhar Hussain: Impact of Balti Dialect in and Outside J&K State

12.00-13.00 *Language And Development*

Tashi Gyalpo (Kurja): Social Status and the Status of Ladakhi Language or "Rangskat"

Konchok Rigzin: Complex Pronunciation of Dialect

H.U. Hamid. Change and Development in Changthang

14.30- 15:45 *Religion and Culture*

Dr Usha Viyas: Buddhist Marriages in Ladakh

Tsering Norboo Wakhapa: Wakha Mulbek. Confluence of Two Faiths

16:00 - 17:30: Parallel Session 1: *Buddhism in Ladakh* Chair: Gelong Thubtan Paldan

Geshe Konchog Namgyal: History of The Bka-Rgyud-Pa Lineage in Ladakh

Jamyang Gyaltzen: An Introduction to the Path Fruit of Sakyapa

16:00 - 18:30: Parallel Session 2. *Buddhism and Social Change*

Chair: John Bray

Tsering Samphel: Vagaries of Demographic Change in Ladakh

Sonam Wangchuk (Ladakhi): Buddhism and Contemporary Society in Ladakh

Robert Cook: Psychology, Buddhism and Sustainable Development

John Crook: Tipun Comes West

John Crook and James Crowden: Concluding Poem.

IALS CONFERENCE PAPERS AND PUBLICATIONS

One of the best things about the IALS is that it attracts members from a wide variety of different nationalities, and from different professional and academic backgrounds. This diversity presents both opportunities and challenges when we bring out our own publications. Our authors have different personal objectives, and we need to address a variety of different audiences.

This note summarises the issues that we discussed at the Leh conference, and our proposals for the immediate future.

The story so far

The IALS has been unusual among international conference organisers in that it published books containing almost all of the papers presented at its first eight conferences (including the two that preceded the founding of the association). The conference volumes reflect the special flavour of the IALS, and they indicate the wide range of interdisciplinary studies on Ladakh. We definitely want to keep the same interdisciplinary breadth in the conferences.

However, there have been problems with the conference publications:

- The biggest problem is distribution. Contributors want their work to be read and discussed. In practice, it is difficult to arrange wide distribution (even within the limited range of people interested in Ladakh) without a commercial publisher.
- Commercial publishers are reluctant to accept conference volumes unless they receive a generous subsidy. The proceedings of the 8th colloquium in Aarhus received a particularly generous subsidy from the Danish government.
- The contents of recent volumes have been arranged by alphabetical order of the authors. Reviewers have commented on the lack of thematic coherence.
- Our university colleagues – particularly those who are still making their names – are under pressure to place their work in recognisable academic publications, and are therefore tempted to take their work elsewhere.

These factors in combination make it difficult to continue the earlier policy of putting all papers presented at our conferences into single volumes of conference papers.

The 1999 Leh conference and the 2001 Oxford conference

The current position reflects the history of the last three conferences. The 1999 conference in Leh was first cancelled and then revived because of the uncertainties surrounding the Kargil war. Some of the people who originally planned to come were unable to do so. Others who made presentations in Leh did not send in their papers. It therefore seemed best to combine the 1999 Leh papers with the 2001 Oxford papers (as we did with the 4th and 5th conferences), and to arrange them thematically.

At present three volumes are in preparation. These include a selection of papers presented in Leh and Oxford, plus some additional contributions. They are subject to academic peer review. These volumes are:

- Art and Material Culture in Ladakh edited by Monisha Ahmed and Clare Harris. This is to be published by Marg in Bombay.
- Ladakhi Histories. Local and Regional Perspectives, edited by myself. I have discussed this with Brill in Leiden, who published a series of books deriving from the International Association of

Tibetan Studies (IATS) conferences. In principle Brill are interested, but need to see the edited papers before making a final decision. I am making good progress, and plan to submit the papers in early 2003. If Brill do not accept the proposal I am confident of finding a good Indian publisher.

- One or possibly two volumes on Ladakhi anthropology and social change (we still need to find a title). Nicky Grist has agreed to edit these papers. Again, we will submit these to Brill.

The 2003 Leh conference

At the most recent conference there were more Ladakhi contributors than 'international' ones, and this serves as a reminder that it is important to address a local audience as well as the international academic communities. The J&K Cultural Academy has offered to publish the proceedings. Taking advantage of this offer, we propose the following approach:

- We plan to bring out a Cultural Academy volume made up of papers of up to 2,000 words in length. These will be subject to editorial review, but in principle we hope to publish a version of most of the papers presented. These proceedings should be available relatively quickly (sometime in 2004 at the latest); they will serve as a good record of the conference; and they will be readily available both to participants and to local Ladakhi readers. Francesca Merrit is working hard on this volume.
- We hope to publish expanded, more 'academic' versions of selected papers in one of the two 'Brill' volumes discussed above. These will be up to 7,000 words in length. Authors will of course be free to submit papers to specialised journals or other publications if they so wish.

This approach seems to offer the best means of making our papers most readily available to our different audiences. We will review our policy at the next colloquium.

Other publications and media

We remain very keen to encourage more contributions - news, articles, research reports to - Ladakh Studies. Please contact Martijn van Beek (etnomvb@hum.au.dk) with your suggestions.

Also, we are keen to review and expand our IALS website. Subject to copyright requirements, we could use the website to publish pdf versions both of conference papers and of earlier articles that are not readily available elsewhere. We would particularly welcome volunteers to help with the website.

Finally, during my recent visit to Ladakh, I was struck by the limited extent to which the work even of well-known IALS authors was known or available locally. Printing in India is relatively cheap. We could explore other formats, for example locally-produced pamphlets summarising recent research on particular topics. We might consider publishing these in association with other local organisations. We should aim to reach both a Ladakhi audience and the many international visitors in the region.

In sum, there are many creative possibilities. To bring them to fruition, we need ideas – and volunteers. Please contact me with your comments, suggestions and proposals.

FUTURE IALS COLLOQUIUM IN KARGIL?

John Bray

Immediately after the 11th colloquium I travelled to Kargil to discuss the possibility of holding an IALS colloquium there. Earlier, security concerns had made this impractical. However, a Kargil conference is overdue: the main questions are when we should hold one, and how we can best overcome potential obstacles. My own recommendations are:

- We should plan to hold an IALS event in Kargil, or elsewhere in Kargil district, either in 2005 or 2007. We should start making plans now, but review them next summer with a view to making a firmer decision then.
- The main problem - as discussed below - is continuing concern about security. To address this concern, we need to share the best available information and assessments, and we need back-up plans.

Please read this note and send me your comments and suggestions.

Meetings

I had long discussions individually with Gulzar Hussein Munshi, Dr Jaffer Akhooon and Dr Mohd Saleem Mir Bhimbhat. I also visited the main hotels, and spoke to the Superintendent of Police, the Tourist Officer, and Mipham Otsal in his capacity as J & K Academy Cultural Officer (the DC was in Srinagar). Gulzar drove me to Sankoo and Kartse, where there is a Chamba sculpture, smaller but similar to the one at Mulbekh, as well as the remains of a small fort. On 30 July we held a meeting attended by 15-20 IALS members and other local scholars. On the way back to Leh, I stopped in Mulbekh for an hour's talk with Master Namgyal, a local Buddhist writer who was invited to the meeting the previous evening, but was unable to attend. Finally, on my return to Leh, I held another meeting with IALS committee members there.

The case for Kargil

The case for Kargil is clear. People kept reminding me - in case I was in any danger of forgetting - that Ladakh begins at the Zoji-la. Several different cultural and linguistic traditions converge in the region. Kargil itself is the main town of Purig, but borders on Baltistan. In Drass, the local language is Shina. Zangskar is within Kargil district. Buddhism is well represented there, as well as in many of the villages east of Kargil. Kargil ought to be better represented in IALS publications and events.

In Kargil I learnt a new Urdu word: moka (opportunity). At the meeting, people said that they wanted an opportunity to share Kargil's riches in front of a wider audience. Helping provide such an opportunity is very much within the IALS's aims and objectives. At the same time, the Kargilis were clear that they wanted the region to be seen in a wider Ladakhi context. They want to 'show-case' Kargil, but without being exclusive. The conference should include presentations from all parts of Ladakh, a local demonstration of 'unity in diversity'. It should not be difficult to obtain official support. The J&K Cultural Academy has already offered to contribute from its resources.

Security issues

Concerns about security will be the biggest problem. Travel advisories issued by Western governments instruct tourists not to go close to the Line of Control (LoC), which is some 16km from

Kargil, and this makes it difficult to obtain insurance. This year there has been continuing firing across the LoC, notably near Drass. There is a continuing sense of insecurity both locally (even though people are doing their best to get on with their lives), and among international visitors. Against this background, the IALS Executive Committee felt that it would not be appropriate to hold the second part of this year's conference in Kargil as originally planned. We need to consider carefully what we should do in future, so that we anticipate problems well in advance.

Whether individuals go to Kargil or not is a matter of personal choice. This summer, there was firing across the LoC, but less than in previous years. As far one can tell, Pakistani firing has been directed against military rather than civilian targets. According to the SP there have been five civilian casualties in the Drass area this year, and it seems that they have been caught up in firing against shifting military positions. The Tourist Officer said that an average of 40 foreign tourists and 60 domestic tourists passed through each day in July. Domestic tourism has picked up substantially in the Kashmir Valley. Obviously, there is an element of risk from Pakistani firings, but in my own mind I compared it with living with the risk of a major earthquake in Tokyo (actually, I think that the latter is a much more serious concern). I do not think that it is irresponsible for individuals to go to Kargil in current circumstances.

The main responsibility of the IALS as a collective body is to give its members the best available information, neither exaggerating nor understating the risks, so that individuals can make their own choices. Even discussing such issues may be scary for some members, but we cannot do less.

Alternative locations

The most natural place to hold the conference would be in Kargil itself. The facilities there include a number of hotels (not luxurious, but adequate), and a government complex with a smart conference hall. However, the Suru valley may be more attractive as well as safer.

With Gulzar, I visited Sankoo, about an hour's drive up the valley. This is a much more beautiful location, free from the dust and noise of the Kargil bazaar. There are PWD and J&K Tourist bungalows, with 10 double bedrooms between them. For the rest, we would have to rely on tents. I did not visit Pannikar, further up the Suru valley. I am told that it is even more beautiful, but again we would need tents. I understand that tents are available from the Tourist Office and are quite comfortable.

In the 1997 Aarhus conference, many of the participants stayed in wooden huts in a seaside 'holiday village'. A Suru variant of this approach would be unusual, but should be feasible. However, it would not remove all security problems as we would still need to drive through Kargil to get there (or come via Zaskar, which would currently require a fair bit of walking).

Finally, if Kargil did not work out, we might be able to arrange an event abroad at relatively short notice. In 1992, we arranged a two-day event at SOAS in London at about six months' notice. However, it would be difficult to obtain grants for Ladakhi participants in that sort of time frame.

What we can do in the short-term

There are quite a few things that we should do in any case to raise Kargil's profile within the IALS:

- Both in Kargil and in Leh, it would be good to hold smaller events between conferences, so that people do not forget that the IALS exists. We could do this in association with local organisations. A possible formula would be an evening meeting combining informal presentations by both local and foreign scholars - say one or two of each.
- We can encourage people who have already done work elsewhere in Ladakh to think of comparative studies in or around Kargil (Nicky Grist has been a pioneer in this respect). I am sure that our Kargil colleagues would be keen to assist.

- It would be good if visiting 'internationals' could meet local scholars to discuss what would be of most interest to an international audience, and how to present it. Among others, I know that Ravina, Monisha and Martijn are already in contact with Kargil colleagues. I hope to be able to visit Kargil again next year.

In sum, there are abundant possibilities and, with goodwill on all sides, I am confident that the IALS can make a real contribution.

QUESTIONS/ANSWERS

Responses to Rebecca Norman's queries in LS17

CHIRU

I have been intrigued by the origin of the word *chiru* for a long time. I have asked Ladakhis, Changpa from Kharnak and Tibetans from all parts of the Plateau about it, and no-one has ever heard the term. As Rebecca Norman wrote in *Ladakh Studies* 17 (p.32), they all use some variant of *tso/tsos*. Jaeschke's 1881 Tibetan dictionary has no mention of *chiru* and lists *gtsod*, *btsod*, *gtso* for Tibetan antelope. It is called *orong* by Mongolian speakers around Koko Nor/Qinghai Hu. Indian zoological colleagues are equally sure it is not of Hindi/Urdu origin either.

It seems likely, based on a reference in Abbé Huc's *Voyages* that *chiru* is a corruption of the Tibetan *gcig-ru* meaning one-horn (several early authors remarked on the animal's resemblance to the mythical unicorn).

The earliest mention I have found is by Lesson, 1827, who referred to 'Antelope chiru' from Nepal. A British zoologist in 1830 also wrote of 'the chiru antelope'. Sterndale's (1884) 'Mammalia of British India' lists among local names "Chiru in Nepal."

However, Abbé Huc (*Travels in Tartary, Thibet and China 1844-46*) describes the "unicorn of Tibet" which he calls "serou" or "bse ru" and also "tsopo". He goes on "Mr Hodgson, an English resident in Nepal . . . has put beyond doubt the question relative to the existence of this species of antelope, called tchirou (chiru-gchig-ru) in Southern Tibet, which borders on Nepal. It is the same word with serou only pronounced differently, according to the varying dialects of the north and of the south." (vol 2, pp 311-313 of the English translation).

It seems therefore that the origin of the term in French and English was via a specimen brought to Nepal from southern Tibet, and referred to as a "unicorn". I had thought that the original finder of this specimen had simply sought a direct Tibetan translation of "one-horn/unicorn." However, it seems from Huc that terms for that animal had long been in use in Tibet (he also provides Mongolian and Chinese terms). It is interesting that he also mentions "tsopo" - very close to the word used now. Perhaps people had one word for the animal they saw and another for the 'mythical' beast (single Tibetan antelope horns are frequently seen for sale, so it would be easy for people to imagine there were two different animals).

Note also that serou is very close to the English serow (*Capricornis sumatrensis*) a different animal and one which occurs in forested parts of eastern Tibet.

QUESTIONS/ANSWERS

GRIM

If language is not correct, then what is said is not what is meant; if what is said is not what is meant, then what must be done remains undone; if this remains undone, morals and art will deteriorate; if justice goes astray, the people will stand about in helpless confusion. Hence there must be no arbitrariness in what is said. This matters above everything. (From *The Analects of Confucius*, Book 13, Verse 3, James R. Ware, transl., 1980)

I was interested to read Rebecca Norman's query in LS 17 about the word "grim" because when I was preparing HBV in Zangskar I made some attempt to pursue its origin without much success. I came across it when I was consulting the official crop records (Girdawari or Jamabandi) for sTongde village, kept by the Patwari land office official at Padum in Urdu, and was told that this was the Urdu term for barley. My memory is that it was used in these records for all varieties of barley but never by local farmers.

However I am puzzled by her term 'beardless barley' since as far as I have seen in both Zangskar and the Indus valley there are no varieties of beardless barley grown (nor elsewhere in the world?); that is without spiky awns projecting above the ear, varying in length and strength with the variety (see illustrations Pl.76, 77 in HBV). Even the local varieties of wheat have beards though less strongly developed. It is thought that photosynthesis in the awns contributes to the growth of the grain.

The term 'naked' which she also uses refers to something quite different. In the varieties of two-row barley most commonly grown in Europe and America the husk is partly fused with the grain making it difficult to separate in threshing (though I do have a naked European barley growing in my garden in England). In the six-row Ladakhi barleys the grains can easily be separated from the chaff just by rubbing the ear between one's hands.

OTTERS AND SNOWLEOPARDS?

John Mock (UC Santa Cruz) writes:

“We were in Pakistan for two months this summer. While there, we heard the narrative about female snow leopards mating with male river otters (*Lutra lutra*). The narrative was most full and detailed in Baltistan and Astor (where Adam Nayyar recorded it years ago), and less complete in Hunza and Gojal. Is it known in Ladakh? (I imagine it is). Is it widespread? Do you know in which areas it is most prevalent? Any citations?”

Replies can be mailed to: jmock@ucsc.edu

ISSUES FOR DEBATE

THE IALS AND ACADEMIC STANDARDS

John Bray

Many of the most important discussions at conferences take place in conversations outside the main proceedings. At Oxford one such discussion concerned the role of the IALS in promoting and maintaining academic standards. This debate has continued since then by e-mail, and in the tea-shops of Leh bazaar. What follows is an attempt to summarise the debate, and what we've learnt from it.

1. GUIDING PRINCIPLES

These 'guiding principles' are a draft. Subject to further comment, I'd like to put them - or a revised version - on our website. They are not intended to cover every eventuality, but rather to indicate an overall approach.

- *Openness*

Membership of the IALS is open to everyone interested in Ladakh studies, and this includes people from different academic backgrounds or none.

- *Standards and aspirations*

Whatever our backgrounds, we aspire to high standards of writing and analysis. One of the IALS's roles is to work with informal scholars and people at the beginning of their academic careers to help them improve the quality of their work, and bring it to a wider audience. Partly with this in mind, we have been introducing the principle of peer review both to Ladakh Studies and to the conference publications. Where the reviewers have constructive suggestions, we will work with authors to try to implement them - though we cannot publish everything that we are sent.

- *Sources*

The basic principle - common to all disciplines - is that we cite our sources. This may be done through footnotes or endnotes, or through a reference in the text. In some cases our Ladakhi colleagues, when reporting from their own experience, may be regarded as primary sources. In such cases there would be no need for literary citations though it would still be appropriate to cite oral sources of information (e.g. the reminiscences of older people), and the places where information has been gathered. The Harvard University website (www.fas.harvard.edu/~expos/sources/chap3.html) gives a detailed set of guidelines on how to avoid plagiarism - the theft of ideas.

- *Responsibilities*

Through the relevant editors, the IALS as a body is responsible for Ladakh Studies and the conference proceedings that go out under its name. We have no responsibility for - or authority over - other publications.

- *Debate*

Ladakh Studies and the conferences serve as a forum for debate. The basic rules of this forum include courtesy to all participants. We may be passionate about our specialities, but not polemical. Politics is a proper subject for analysis, but we should avoid anything that may be seen as partisan. Where we disagree, we may attack arguments and analyses, but not people or personalities.

In practice applying these principles will require judgement and skill as well as goodwill. The following extracts from the e-mail correspondence illustrate some of the points that have caused the most contention.

2. OWNERSHIP OF IDEAS

One of the most sensitive issues concerns the development, history and 'ownership' of ideas. To a greater or lesser extent, we all stand on the shoulders of our illustrious predecessors. Some ideas have become so widely accepted that all sorts of people draw on them without being conscious of their origins. However, particularly in a field that is relatively new, it is important to cite people who have helped set the agenda, as well as those who have made the most recent contributions.

Patrick Kaplanian underlines this point in a letter written in December 2001. He takes it for granted that deliberate plagiarism is unacceptable. It is therefore essential to avoid citing the work of plagiarists, but rather to cite the original sources - even if this means taking extra trouble to read the work of all one's predecessors.

"Si on ne cite pas les plagiaires ceux-ci sont éliminés de facto, sans polémique, sans violence. Ils n'existent pas, c'est tout... Car si le plagiat est du vol, la citation d'un plagiaire en lieu et place de la personne plagiée est de la complicité de vol."

However, this principle raises the question what exactly constitutes an original source. In a subsequent e-mail in June 2003, Patrick takes up a point made by Martin Mills who says :

"If a researcher finds out a piece of information concerning for example Wanla village life, it is not plagiarism for him to mention this without reference to a similar piece of information in the literature that concerns another village."

Patrick strongly disagrees, and draws an analogy from the history of science. Marie Curie discovered radium A later researcher experimenting with uranium from Niger or Australia might well find out more about the specific characteristics of uranium or about the minerals from which it is extracted. However, they could scarcely claim to be the original discoverer of the element Only one person discovered radium, and that was Marie Curie. The same principle applies to researchers on kinship or village hierarchies in Ladakh. Patrick comments:

"Si j'ai bien compris il suffirait à un ethnologue de s'installer dans un village du Ladakh qui n'a pas encore été étudié-Gya ou Bazgo par exemple-et de redécouvrir qu'il y a des riks (rigs), des khangpa et des khangchung, des lhatho, des goba, churpon, lorapa etc., etc. et il deviendrait un découvreur de première main à égalité avec ceux qui avaient trouvé exactement la même chose ailleurs. Et en plus c'est lui qu'on citerait parce qu'on n'a pas le temps de tout lire!"

Patrick argues that the first person to say that there are - say - lorapa or churpon (chu dpon) in Ladakhi villages is the person who has discovered this. Another anthropologist arriving in a village can easily make enquiries about the presence of a lorapa or a churpon because they are already familiar with the concept. They might discover local variations, for example that the churpon is elected in one village, whereas in other villages people take turns to play this role. In that case, they should concentrate on what is specific to the village without simply repeating what is already known as though they are discovering it for the first time.

However, how exactly does one define originality? In an e-mail from January 2002, Martijn van Beek takes issue with Patrick:

"... surely you don't mean to suggest that first is best? In that case, we should all be citing Ramsay, Moorcroft, Drew, et al? The point of a citation is not to indicate the first person to breach a word on a topic, but those works which are relevant for the discussion one is engaged in: Ramsay-or Kaplanian-may be relevant, but will not always be that. The first text may, for example, be wrong or incomplete, or have an interpretation of a phenomenon which is theoretically unproductive. In certain kinds of scholarly publications, it would still be relevant to cite the earliest references, particularly in the case of ethnographic details. But one does not always have to cite Tylor or Frazer to discuss the concept of culture, for example. I will return to this in answering your three questions below. In general one might say that a later source or account is not necessarily secondary!"

He adds that it is also important to take account of one's audience:

"... no general journal will accept an article which cites every text that has ever been written on a topic. Whether one cites the correct or necessary sources is, therefore, a matter of judgement, and picking one's sources carefully is obviously something that distinguishes the good from the poor scholar. In specialist regional or topical journals or books, it may well be necessary to cite the whole range of authors on, e.g., *gtor.log* -- not only re. Ladakh, but also Tibet. But when I write for a general audience ... there are limits to how much detail I should convey. This is not intended to be the final or exhaustive discussion of the ritual. Whether a discussion or a citation is relevant, in other words, also depends on the particular story, the theoretical points, the ethnographic detail, and the audience one wants or needs to address."

3. 'ON PLAGIARISM, PRIMACY AND THE INDIGENOUS VOICE'

At this point, we asked Martin Mills to write a considered view of the issues, and his detailed argument appears alongside this summary. As you will see, he challenges notions of 'intellectual property', particularly when applied to social science research on Ladakh, and concludes: "... knowledge itself can never be owned, because unlike material possessions, the act of passing knowledge on to others makes us all richer, not poorer."

4. RESPONSES TO MARTIN MILLS

Martin's article has been circulating by e-mail this summer, and has itself prompted vigorous debate. In a presidential e-mail from last August, Henry Osaston challenged Martin's arguments. 'Ownership' of ideas or information may be an appropriate concept in such fields as patents, privacy or copyright. However, in this field there are different justifications for 'acknowledging previous workers and especially those who initiated and substantiated particular ideas'. These are:

- First is a moral duty to acknowledge the priority of whoever first had the insight and performed the labour to formulate/observe/analyse/synthesise the idea. 'Priority' and 'idea' here have universal meanings: an idea developed in context A has priority over a similar idea developed later in a similar context B, which should be acknowledged, for the two following reasons also.
- The second is its 'utility' in providing a reader with a frame of reference and a lead into the literature on the subject.

- The third is quality assurance to show that the writer is indeed familiar with this field of study and has duly considered the ways in which previous work may corroborate or conflict with her/his own studies.

In a similar vein, in a September e-mail, Bettina Zeisler challenges an analogy that Martin draws with genetics. At the same time, she gives a personal insight into the trials of an academic linguist suffering from sleepless nights:

"As Martin mentioned, there might be a lot of common knowledge particularly about culture (and not so much about genes), which is shared by society and is taken as granted but, for exactly this reason, not much discussed. It might still need the perspective of an outsider to perceive implications or the 'wider context'.

Take, e.g., the linguist B.Z. who comes to Ladakh from time to time. Of course, her Ladakhi informants know much better how to speak their language than she will ever do. However, they hardly ever can tell you why they say something in a particular context but not in another one. Or they might be convinced that they would never, ever say X, until you find a very specific context where X is not only possible, but in fact the only possible or natural way of expression.

If, by chance, she comes across a very interesting fact, she might not be able to go to bed as ordinary people do. When she is about to fall to sleep, she may get an idea which wakes her up and makes her go back to her notebook lest the idea disappear for the next three months. The same happens in the morning before she is really awake: an idea creeps through her dreams and makes her reluctantly rise up much earlier than planned (or deserved)."

"In her work B.Z. came across a lot of interesting facts and developed some ideas of how this all belonged together, and how it had to be interpreted. As the facts were there independently of her, other people might have come to similar conclusions. But none of them made an effort to bring it into a system and to write an article or book.

B.Z. certainly has no intellectual property of the Ladakhi language. But with her article or book, with the particular methods, her systematic layout, the line of argument, and the particular choice of examples, she has created a new cultural artefact of which she holds intellectual property."

5. EXERCISING JUDGEMENT

Martijn van Beek's most recent e-mail on this topic agrees with the spirit of Henry's observations on 'best practice' while repeating his own earlier points: the first source may not always be the most appropriate one to cite, because it could be wrong or limited. Certain facts are common knowledge. What needs citing will depend in part on editorial policy and the audience one is writing for. He concludes:

"I believe that part of our disagreement stems from the differences between the sciences and humanities (and social sciences), where the latter have a less stable concept of facts and 'discovery', and hence are less inclined to attribute greatest significance to first descriptions per se. So, while I agree that a first, substantial contribution to a given topic will commonly need to be acknowledged, it is impossible in my opinion to make this a hard and fast rule. Judgement will always be needed: the author's, the editor's."

As I write this late at night, I share both Martijn's views on the need for judgement, and Bettina's concern for sleepless nights that may not be wholly deserved.

I think that it is impractical for an organisation such as the IALS to legislate for all possible circumstances, which is why I began this note with a set of 'principles' rather than 'rules'. At the same time, this whole debate has made all of us more sensitive to the need for proper attribution and respect for earlier scholars' work. I don't expect this to be the last word, but I trust that this principle at least has been firmly established.

ISSUES FOR DEBATE

ON PLAGIARISM, PRIMACY AND THE INDIGENOUS VOICE

Martin A. Mills

At various points over the last few years, a number of scholars within the IALS have highlighted the issue of the use of sources within academic writing about Ladakh and Zangskar. Amongst other things, the accusation has been laid [it has been argued] that due credit is not being given by present works to the contributions of earlier scholars to the corpus of knowledge about Ladakh and Zangskar, and that as a result these earlier contributions are in effect being plagiarised.

Obviously, Ladakh and Zangskar are the subject of a very considerable quantity of published material, much of which — from journalism to travelogues and the ubiquitous ‘coffee-table book’ — makes no claim to being ‘research’ and therefore should in no sense be held to academic standards of proof, referencing and non-plagiarism; however, the region is also the object of a very considerable research enterprise, including first and foremost the RRoL series, wherein accepted standards of academic and intellectual rigour apply. Given the recent plethora of articles on academic plagiarism within the Indian press, now seems an apposite moment to discuss this question amongst ourselves.

This is, I would argue, not simply an issue of intellectual probity within Ladakh Studies as a whole, but also one which has bearing on the IALS’s contribution to an accepted body of academic knowledge, and on how we understand our relationship with research informants. To my own mind, two separate but linked issues are of concern: firstly, the precise definition of plagiarism and its distinction from the far more prevalent but less serious fault of the inadequate contextualising of one’s own research; and secondly, the question of the ‘ownership’ of socially-derived knowledge. Without wishing to open up too much of a can of worms by examining specific cases, the Newsletter seems as good a place as any to discuss these issues in a measured way, and I thank the editors for suggesting this as a topic. The following, it must be added, are my own views, rather than those of the IALS itself, and is primarily for the purposes of discussion, rather than any kind of statement of policy.

Plagiarism and Inadequate Scholarship

By and large, the academic world is broadly united in its definition of the content of plagiarism. To be most pedantic, the Shorter Oxford Dictionary (3rd edn.) defines the act of plagiarism ‘the taking and using as one’s own of the thoughts, writings or inventions of another’. A more explicit elaboration of this idea, as used by my own University for examinations, derives from the British Quality Assurance Agency:

“Plagiarism is the substantial use, without acknowledgement and with intent to deceive [others] or knowing that [others] might be deceived, of the intellectual work of other people by representing, whether by copying or paraphrase, the ideas or discoveries of another or of others as one’s own...”¹

¹ http://www.abdn.ac.uk/registry/quality/section6.hti#6_13_3, 9th January 2003.

In most academic and research traditions, plagiarism constitutes an extremely serious offence against the both standards and persons of the community of scholars within which it occurs, and rightly evokes extremely strong reaction. However, experience (familiar to many fellow university academics, I have no doubt) shows that even the elaborate definition discussed above is capable of certain misreadings, which would bear clarification. These primarily revolve around the distinction between plagiarism in its strict sense, and inadequate acknowledgement of the work of previous scholars: whilst the latter may innocently derive from inadequate scholarship, it often causes entirely reasonable offence; the former, however, is a deliberate fraudulent act, and correctly brings into question the status of the offending writer as a bona fide scholar.

Firstly, as can be seen from the definition above, plagiarism implies a deliberate and knowing act of dishonesty in the misuse of sources, rather than mere academic sloppiness. It comprises a conscious attempt to claim credit for work undertaken, that does not rightly belong to one. For example, one cannot plagiarise a work that one has never encountered. Thus, if researcher A explicitly quotes from researcher B, who has (unknown to A) plagiarised the material from researcher C, A is not plagiarising C, because to cite a text as a source is to state where you yourself got the information, rather than to enumerate all places where it has previously been written or spoken, or where it 'ultimately' came from. Research on Ladakh, in particular, is a multi-lingual milieu, and individual scholars cannot reasonably be expected to know all possible precursors to their work, whether in English, Dutch, German, French, Japanese, Ladakhi, Urdu, Tibetan or ancient Sanskrit. In this sense, it is important to distinguish between ideal academic practice and honest academic practice: the former is something to be striven towards on an individual and collective basis, whilst the second is the absolute basis of all valid research.

Secondly, it is worth noting that plagiarism requires both the taking and using of another's work as one's own. It is not sufficient, therefore, for a writer merely to have replicated the conclusions or work of another, for that work to be classed as plagiarism. To give an example: Researcher A writes an ethnographic work discussing the patrilineal inheritance of households in Stongde village. Ten years later, researcher B carries out similar fieldwork in Stongde, and from the results of his own fieldwork writes a similar piece (with similar findings) about household inheritance in Stongde. B makes no reference to A's writings, even though B had, subsequent to doing his fieldwork, read A's work. B's work — by (in this case, almost deliberately) ignoring previously published research — certainly constitutes an inadequate (and arguably reprehensible) piece of academic writing; however, it does not constitute plagiarism, because the source of his published knowledge was his field research in Stongde village, not A's writings. He has not taken A's findings and represented them as his own. It is also possible to argue that B claims some of A's credit by virtue of implicitly asserting primacy — in other words that B is encouraging the reader to think that he (and not A) is the first to gather and collect that material. Thanks to Henry Osmaston here. I would argue that whilst this is emotionally quite a strong assertion, it is actually extremely problematic, for two reasons — the first methodological, and the second ethical. Methodologically, since the two pieces of research were carried out at some time from one another (ten years), one could argue that they effectively constitute different bits of knowledge; similarly, the fact that Stongde villagers say pha-spun members are 'of one bone' is different knowledge from the fact that the villagers of, for example, Lingshed or Hemis Shukpa Chen say it. It would only be the same knowledge if Ladakh and Zangskar had a unitary, homogenous and unchanging culture, which (as we know from the many works on pha-spun at least) they don't. Consequently, the idea that they constitute 'one discovery' is problematic. Ethically, however, the issue of primacy faces us with the much more substantial question of 'whose knowledge is it anyway?', to which I will return at greater length at the second part of this piece.

Thirdly, most statutes on academic plagiarism take into account the possibility that some knowledge is in such wide circulation that it is broadly accepted to be true. For example, Cambridge University regulations state that "Common knowledge, the kind of thing which you will find in almost

any textbook on a topic (e.g. 1066: the date of the Battle of Hastings), need not be referenced".² We might reasonably wonder, however, what "common knowledge" means in an intercultural context such as Ladakh Studies. Most would agree, for example, that it is unnecessary to produce references in support of the assertion that Buddhist monks are ideally celibate, that Kargil town is close to the Pakistani border, or that Spituk monastery is within the Gelukpa Order. While the last of these may not be common in the sense of widely known, it shares with the date of the Battle of Hastings the quality of being commonly accepted as true. By contrast, assertions about or interpretations of, for example, pha-spun household groups tend to be more controversial and therefore require careful referencing because they embody what Cambridge University refer to as "the distinctive views of particular authors".

These considerations present us with certain conundrums when it comes to Ladakh Studies. There is, for example, a wide body of information and interpretation accepted as 'common knowledge' within Ladakh studies, which actually derives from the specific work of present IALS members over the last 30 years. That such a transformation in the nature of much such knowledge has occurred, arguably derives from the success of the IALS as a community of scholars. However it does mean that, in some cases, one person's quotable research achievement has become another person's un-attributed common knowledge, precisely because of the persuasiveness and authority of the former.

However, whilst the growth of a substantial corpus of 'common knowledge' is in many respects a laudable outcome, clearly it has its dangers, not least in the manner in which such a status implies an intellectual sanctity, such that it not only goes un-attributed, but also unexamined and unquestioned. Both in the sense of the credit due to earlier researchers for work carried out, and in terms of the problematic tendency towards a corpus of 'common knowledge', it would seem incumbent upon an organisation such as the IALS to ensure that the sources of such common knowledge remain as explicit and available as possible.

² <http://www.divinity.cam.ac.uk:8000/Graduates/Plagiarism.html>, 6 January 2003.

Here, however, we are faced with both a challenge and an opportunity. Whilst John Bray has done us an incomparable service through the compilation of bibliographies of Ladakh studies, it remains the case that the vast majority of research on Ladakh (including the RRoL series) has been published through limited and non-repeating print runs, and is thus either inaccessible or beyond the narrow budgets of younger and less well-connected researchers. Such a situation was simply a fact of life twenty or even ten years ago, but the advent of reliable and widely available web resources allows us to overcome this hurdle with comparative ease and at a relatively minuscule cost. In particular, the conversion of out-of-print papers into PDF format files available through a central IALS website would represent a service not simply to ourselves, but also to the wider community of Indian, Himalayan and Tibet scholars beyond the boundaries of Ladakh studies.³ Such an innovation would not only benefit those presently carrying out research. It would also give full credit to the previous labours of those around us, much of which has passed into a lamentable obscurity - allowing it to be overlooked by those more newly-arrived in the field or, worse, to be plagiarised with impunity simply because of its sheer inaccessibility.

Plagiarism and the 'Ownership' of Knowledge

Much can therefore be done to both clarify the linked issues of plagiarism and inadequate contextualising of research, and to bring on board a sharper appreciation of the genealogies of research knowledge. However, some caveats are necessary regarding the status of research knowledge as 'belonging' to particular researchers. I mention this because, whilst there is broad agreement on the definition of plagiarism - and to a fundamental academic and intellectual ethic which values deference to sources as an abiding constitutional issue - most of us will be aware that there are certain debates concerning the significance of plagiarism within the global academic community.

In particular, in my own experience, many East Asian academic traditions see knowledge as so thoroughly embedded within particular intellectual genealogies as to render the legal sanction of plagiarism almost non-sensical; by contrast, the European intellectual traditions - to which much of South Asia and North America are heir - take a very administrative stance regarding plagiarism, seeing it as a matter upon which entire academic careers can hang. In the British case, it is most often described as a 'serious breach of professional etiquette', unearthing of which places one de facto beyond the pale of the academic community. By contrast, many American universities insist upon a legal dimension, with (for example) Harvard asserting that "plagiarism is the theft of someone else's ideas and work".⁴

³ This possibility has been verbally aired at several IALS meetings to my knowledge. My thanks, however, to Jill Sudbury for reminding me of its clear relevance to this issue.

⁴ <http://www.extension.harvard.edu/2001-02/policy/honesty.shtml#plagiarism>, 6 January 2003.

This last position carries within it a danger of knowledge itself being seen as ‘ownable’, and therefore as ‘stealable’ in the first place. In a world where an increasing amount of ‘intellectual property’ is being laid claim to in the courts, it is perhaps worth being very clear as to who we think ‘knowledge about Ladakh’ ultimately belongs to, if anyone. In the context of the natural sciences, answering this question has been a complex process – does particular genetic knowledge, for example, belong to the research scientist, the company that funded the research, or to ‘humanity as a whole’? In each case, however, the argument revolves around precisely defining the legitimate social ownership of the source of the knowledge.

In the case of disciplines that derive their knowledge from social research (which counts for most works produced within the Ladakh studies context), this question is perhaps clearer. Rarely if ever (with the exception of some of our eminent geologists and possibly archaeologists) does the actual knowledge that we contribute to ‘Ladakh Studies’ come from ourselves, but rather from our informants (this remains true whether the researcher in question is German, Ladakhi, Indian, American, Zangskari or French). Prior to being ‘research’, it existed in the knowledge, social discourse and (again, often) writings (some of them published) of Ladakhis themselves. Since this applies to the overwhelming majority of all meaningful social, religious, political and historical data, claims by (in particular, Western) researchers to the ownership of anything but the interpretation of received information need to be made very cautiously indeed. I am very wary of using the term ‘Western’ here, since much of this discussion pertains as much to the research work of, for example, Indian and Japanese scholars as it does to European and American ones. Seeking greater precision in this matter would, however, require discussions about the nature of new global ‘knowledge economies’, its relationship to histories of colonial expansion, and so forth, which would easily double the size of this paper!

In this regard, my own impression has been that the more amateur (in the older, less pejorative, sense of the word) writings of earlier scholars — particularly in the anthropological field — were often more careful in specifying the precise persons and circumstances from which they gleaned their knowledge; by contrast, the pressures of modern professionalisation lead many researchers (including, on more than one occasion, myself) to obscure the specifics of their fieldwork conditions, such that the comments of two elderly ladies sitting on a wall one long afternoon become transformed into a sociologically significant study of gender attitudes! Particularly in the case of many modern non-Ladakhi scholars, attribution of knowledge to the indigenous informants from which it derives is haphazard at best (occasionally for good reasons, such as preserving the confidentiality of informants, but the point remains) and non-existent at worst.

This brings us back to the vexed question of primacy in research on Ladakh. In the general run of academic affairs, the publication of research data is rarely if ever an explicit claim to primacy, although in certain fields (and Ladakh studies is one of them) such a claim is often implicit. This latter, implicit claim is, I would argue, a feature of the precise cultural nature of Ladakh Studies as an intellectual endeavour, rather than of research publication as a whole; and it is a feature which I would argue is illegitimate and unsupportable in principle. To take a comparative example, if an American historian cites a letter from Churchill as part of an argument about the nature of the Second World War, or cites a set of English parish records as the basis for an argument about population movement in the 18th century, he is not making an intrinsic claim to be the first person to have cited those letters or records (a claim to primacy), nor is he under any pressure to make reference to everyone else who has used those resources. However, this claim is often made in the case of Ladakh studies, because we maintain an intellectual ethos that sees Ladakh research as primarily an act of ‘discovery and exploration’ within an unknown territory, rather than ‘valid research and correct understanding’. Now, of course, Ladakh and Zangskar are only ‘unknown territory’ to those that do not live there, or whose families have not lived there for several hundred years. As such, the “discovery and exploration” understanding of research implies that what really matters here is not that things are correctly understood, but rather who was the first Westerner to

'discover' the information. By using this kind of concept of primacy at all, we are therefore in danger of logically collapsing "knowledge about Ladakh" down into "Western knowledge about Ladakh" - which implies that Ladakhi knowledge about Ladakh is not 'Ladakh studies'. Clearly, then, claims to primacy (including the whole ethos of research as 'discovery') run the danger of placing an intellectual, social and methodological barrier between Ladakhis and non-Ladakhis as a constituting feature of what is accepted as Ladakh studies. Since the IALS has, from its very inception, sought to unite the activities and interests of both Ladakhi and non-Ladakhi scholars in a shared endeavour of understanding and insight, such a barrier — no matter how implicit or subtly hidden — seems worth rejecting from the outset.

Conclusions?

What, if anything, can we derive from this? Clearly, few would I imagine disagree that more explicit referencing to sources is a good thing; indeed, much can be learned from the laudable precision of Ladakhi religious culture in specifying lineages of forebears. It is incumbent on all scholars to give credit to those on whose shoulders they stood, and it is reasonable enough that those that go to the time, effort and expense to carry out research in Ladakh and Zangskar should receive reasonable credit for their labours. In this respect, it is indeed the case that many of the younger generation of IALS scholars tend to disregard many earlier works in the production of their own writings (again, I would count myself in this number), and thus do themselves and others a significant disservice. As I argued above, much can be done to mitigate this.

Nonetheless, we should be wary of asserting or claiming the right to ownership of that knowledge (either individually or collectively), to the extent to which we feel that it can, *vide* Harvard, be 'stolen' from us or others. To do so runs the danger of setting up too much of a distinction between a professionalised non-Ladakhi research community and those whose traditions it studies: the same professional courtesy and intellectual respect that we afford to other researchers should also be afforded to our informants, many of whom have gone through equal rigours to master the knowledge which they give away so freely. To make legalistic claims to knowledge necessarily implies that the knowledge we claim for ourselves was, similarly, 'stolen' from our original informants in the first place. Such a commodification of knowledge — and the cycle of claim and counter-claim that derives from it — has led Native American studies to its present fractious political state, and is almost certainly not a route that we should be pursuing from whatever angle. While respect (and indeed occasionally payment) can and should be given for the act of clarifying and disseminating knowledge, knowledge itself can never be owned, because unlike material possessions, the act of passing knowledge on to others makes us all richer, not poorer.

DISSERTATION ABSTRACT

THE FRAGILE WEB OF ORDER: CONFLICT AVOIDANCE AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION IN LADAKH. Fernanda Pirie. D.Phil thesis, Wolfson College, University of Oxford, Trinity Term, 2002.

ABSTRACT

Ladakhi society is a constellation of village communities encapsulated within a modern nation state. This thesis undertakes a fine-grained analysis of the legal realm of one village. It explores the nature of the Ladakhis' mediation practices, their abhorrence of all forms of conflict, the responsibility taken by the village community for resolving disputes, the submission by the individual to the consensus-based decisions of the village meeting and the ceremonial restoration of good relations. The attitudes of these villagers are also shared by the educated, urban Ladakhis, who shun the formal frameworks of the Indian state's laws and judicial procedures in favour of local mediation.

This thesis raised theoretical questions about the ambit of 'the law' and legal anthropology. The Ladakhis have distinctive practices by which they maintain order and resolve disputes, but they do so without laws, courts or a concept of 'rights'. They have a legal culture, rather than a system of laws. This legal culture is linked to the Ladakhis' concepts of community, the exercise of power within those communities, the legitimisation of authority, the local and Buddhist moral schemes and their concepts of the person.

The way in which power is distributed and limited by systems of rotation and chance within the Ladakhi village also reflects the judicial realms of the wider Ladakhi and Tibetan regions. An analysis of these realms reveals a separation between political and judicial authority, a preference for mediation over adjudication and the devolution of responsibility for the resolution of disputes to local levels. This reflects patterns of centralisation and decentralisation, hierarchy and equality, which are found widely in ethnographic Tibet. At the heart of legal practices in both the centralised regimes of this region and the semi-autonomous Ladakhi village, is a particular concept of order. Unlike the judicial order which is imposed by superordinate and external authorities in the west, the organising principle for Tibetan peoples is the concept of an immanent, rather than a transcendent, order, one which is human, internally generated and individually maintained.

BOOK REVIEWS

Monisha Ahmed. 2002 *Living Fabric: Weaving among the Nomads of Ladakh Himalaya*. Bangkok, Orchid Press. 192 pp., 3 maps, 9 b/w, 178 colour illus. ISBN 974-8304-87-6 (hb). US\$50, GBP 35.00.

At last, at last. The book we've all been waiting for. The first serious academic study of the nomadic herdspeople of any part of Ladakh's Chang-thang, *Living Fabric*, which was recently awarded the Textile Society of America's Shep Award for best book in the field of ethnic textile studies published in 2002, is part anthropological survey, and part analysis of a community's textiles. As such, it will be read with pleasure and profit by the Ladakh studies fraternity, as well as by students of textiles, anthropologists, and specialists in nomadic studies. The importance of weaving for the Rupshu Chang-pa may come as a revelation to many students of Ladakh.

Over a period of ten years, Monisha Ahmed spent many months living alongside the Rupshu-pa, acquiring insight into all aspects of their life through her study of their textiles. Monisha's background in social anthropology led her to an appreciation of the symbolic as well as practical significance that textiles have in this community, and how they can be understood as an indicator of its religious and social dynamics. This is particularly illuminating as regards gender relations, since women and men weave different types of cloth for different uses, and on different looms. Although from a practical point of view the fabrics woven by women (snam-bu for clothing and some types of blanket and saddle-bag) are quite as essential as those woven by men (tent fabric, saddle-bags and blankets) it is disconcerting to learn that the whole discourse of spinning and weaving is directed to pointing up women's spiritual inferiority to men. In the Rupshu creation myth, weaving was the means by which recalcitrant demonesses were transformed into women, and women are obliged to weave regularly to avoid reverting to demonesses. There is also a perceived connection between weaving and fertility.

The book's focus on textiles goes far beyond the actual weaving process and the symbolism attached to different kinds of fabric. It includes livestock management, since the Rupshu-pa's textiles are basically created from the wool of their sheep, goats and yak. The discussion of the mechanics of migration is made all the more vivid by the evocation of the author's own experience. It also involves an analysis of the *re-bo* or tent, woven from the hair of a family's yak: its structure—often incorporating panels woven by the present owners' fathers and grandfathers, as well as more recent ones made as and when repairs have become necessary—and the spatial relations within it. Of particular interest to me was the analysis of the contemporary trade in wool and pashm, especially how some of the old players from the pre-Independence period remain involved.

Numerous references to the Tibetan tradition, both sociologically and as regards textiles, place the Rupshu-pa squarely in that context; some allusion to the Kirghiz and other non-Buddhist nomadic

communities of central Asia with developed weaving traditions, however, might have added illuminating comparative insights.

If there is a criticism, it is that in describing the technicalities of cloth-making, Monisha makes insufficient concession to those people—probably a majority of her IALS readership—who have only the vaguest idea of textile technology. I suspect many of us would be at a loss to appreciate the difference between a one-heddle, a two-heddle and a three-heddle loom. Again, most of us think we've seen men spinning on hand-spindles in the villages of Ladakh, but here we're informed that in central Ladakh as in Rupshu, what the men are doing is twisting yarn; only women actually spin. Although the distinction between twisting and spinning is clear to the Ladakhis, the definitions used here to explain the difference are decidedly confusing to a non-specialist. On the other hand, there is no discussion of the technique by which women weave designs into the fabric of blankets and saddle-bags.

The long period over which Monisha lived with the Rupshu-pa collecting the material for this book has made her acutely conscious of the changes that have occurred and are occurring within this vulnerable society. The importance of choice is raised by the fact that the Rupshu women have resisted well-meaning attempts by the administration to persuade them to switch over from their traditional backstrap loom to a foot-operated one. The latter would increase their productivity no doubt, but the symbolism is wrong; weaving is a sacred activity, so it's not proper to involve the foot, the 'lowest' part of the body, in it. On the other hand, they have taken with enthusiasm to the use of the coloured acrylic yarn now commercially available in the bazaar at Leh, which they use to extend the scope of design in their bags and blankets. There is also of course the bigger question of change—as the world changes around them how long will the lifestyle of the Rupshu-pa remain viable? Already there is a steady trickle of out-migration, though Monisha only mentions this without detailed discussion.

Of course *Living Fabric* doesn't address all the questions about the Chang-pa, or even the Rupshu-pa—one text can hardly cover everything. Issues like the extent of the support systems provided by the administration, or the use of the pastures, and whether these are suffering from over-grazing, are barely touched on. But it's a magnificent start to Chang-pa studies. It should be required reading for all serious students of Ladakh, and an inspiration for those who may feel inclined to turn their attention to the bleak upland pasturelands and their inhabitants.

H. Louis Fader. 2002. *Called from Obscurity. The Life and Times of a True Son of Tibet, God's Humble Servant from Poo Gergan Dorje Tharchin*. With a Foreword by His Holiness Dalai Lama XIV of Tibet and an Introduction by Dawa Norbu. Vol. 1. Kalimpong: Tibet Mirror Press. 550 pp., 64 plates, maps. ISBN No. 99933-732-1-4. Available from the press at: 10th Mile Rishi Road, Kalimpong – 734301. Dt Darjeeling, West Bengal.

Gergan Dorje Tharchin (1890-1976) spent the greater part of his life in Kalimpong, near Darjeeling. Widely known simply as “Tharchin Babu-la”, he was an important figure in the political, social, and cultural life of the eastern Himalayas and of Tibet. Tharchin was a teacher, Christian minister and editor of the *Tibet Mirror*, which for many years was the only Tibetan-language newspaper. As Professor Dawa Norbu says in the introduction to this book, he was “a towering modern man of letters in a field traditionally dominated by lamas, a lone modernizer in a tradition-bound society, and above all the most articulate spokesman for Tibet's freedom.”

Although Tharchin's main life's work was accomplished in Kalimpong, he was born in Poo, Kinnaur. In 1865 Poo had become the second of the Moravian church's three main mission stations in the Himalayan region. As a child, Tharchin came under the influence of the missionaries, and—from a distance—he remained in contact with European and Ladakhi Moravian leaders in adult life. Arguably, the *Tibet Mirror* was the successor to A.H. Francke's *La dvags kyi ag bar*, which was started in 1904. Tharchin also collaborated with the Moravians on revisions of Tibetan Bible translations.

Tharchin played an important part in many people's lives. The Amdo intellectual Gedun Chomphel contributed to Tharchin's newspaper, and Heather Stoddard discusses the two men's friendship in *Le mendiant de l'Amdo*, (Paris: Société d'ethnographie, 1985). Similarly, the Japanese traveller Hisao Kimura has described his own contacts with Tharchin—who was then also working for British intelligence—in the late 1940s (*Japanese agent in Tibet*. With Scott Berry. London: Serindia, 1990). However, until now there has been no full-length biography of Tharchin himself.

This is the first book of a projected three-volume study, and concentrates on the first part of Tharchin's life until the early 1920s. The first 150 pages are mainly concerned with Poo, the Hindustan-Tibet road and Simla. With the help of the Moravian Unity's archivist in Herrnhut, Fader has been able to draw on contemporary mission records—and on Tharchin's personal papers—as well as a wide variety of printed publications from the nineteenth century onwards.

Fader's own interest in Tharchin was first aroused by his connection with Sadhu Sundar Singh, the Sikh Christian convert who became a well-known figure in both India and the West in the 1920s, and is thought to have disappeared in Tibet in 1929. Much of the second part of the book—a total of four chapters—is a detailed discussion of the Sadhu's relationship with Tharchin. In the 1920s, Sadhu Sundar Singh's claims to have visited Tibet and to have encountered an aged Christian Maharishi near Mount Kailash were the source of fierce controversy. Fader considers the arguments and counter-arguments, and comes out firmly in favour of the Sadhu's honesty.

Fader writes in the Christian tradition: each chapter begins with a Bible verse, and the main theme is God's providence in leading Tharchin from obscurity in Poo to his later prominence in Kalimpong and Tibet. The book is carefully documented—there are no less than 150 pages of endnotes. In his determination to include all important details, Fader explores not only the main plot of Tharchin's life-story, but also sub-plots and sub-sub-plots. As a concession to readers with limited stamina, he eventually plans to produce a single-volume summary of his three-volume study. However, as Dawa Norbu points out, Fader's style may not be inappropriate to his subject: 'After all, literate Tibetans used to express themselves with care, dignity and seriousness - and with a ceremonial slowness'. Fader is writing an epic, and the best is yet to come.

Eileen Hewson. 2002. *Himalayan Headstones from Ladakh Kashmir*. London: British Association for Cemeteries in South Asia. 34 pp. illus. maps. ISBN 0 907799 79 5. [Obtainable from the Secretary, BACSA, 78½ Chartfield Avenue, London SW15 6HQ, UK. Price £6.60 including postage.]

Successive travellers, settlers and administrators have left their mark on Ladakh in the form of rock inscriptions, mani walls, stupas and other monuments. This booklet documents a different kind of monument: the headstones commemorating European and other travellers and missionaries in cemeteries in Leh and elsewhere in Ladakh. The author includes biographical information about most of the deceased and, in doing so, gives a colourful, often poignant insight into their lives.

The booklet begins with a description of the 'European cemetery', which is behind 'Alpha Mess'—formerly the residence of the British Joint Commissioner—in Karzoo, Leh. The most imposing monument there is the granite obelisk erected to the memory of Ferdinand Stoliczka, an Austro-Hungarian geologist. Stoliczka died aged 44 on the return journey from Yarkand with the British Mission. The other graves in the cemetery belong to: Herbert Broke Turnor of the 71st Highland Light Infantry, who died in Leh in 1881; Andrew Dalgleish, a Scottish trader and explorer who was murdered on the Karakoram Pass in 1888; Fr Daniel Kilty, the first resident Roman Catholic missionary in Leh, who died in 1889; and Mrs Ethel Mary Florence Bontein, who died in 1902. There are also two more recent graves: Maj Gen Sir Maurice Dowse, who collapsed in Leh in 1986 while on a tour organised by the Royal Society for Asian Affairs; and Crzla Romano, a 'free spirit' who died in the same year while on a solitary trek to the Markha valley.

The author then turns to the Moravian cemetery, near the airport road. At a time when SARS is seizing world headlines, it is salutary to be reminded of the high death rate of the European missionaries and their children in 19th and early 20th century Ladakh. FA Redslob, the first resident missionary in Leh, and Dr Karl Marx, the first missionary doctor, both succumbed to typhus in 1891. Irene Petrie from the Church Missionary Society in Kashmir died while on a visit to Leh in 1894. Marx was eventually succeeded by Dr FE Shawe, who served in Leh from 1897-1907: the cemetery contains the remains of Shawe's first wife, one of his children, and finally of Shawe himself. Altogether, the Christian cemeteries at Leh and Khalsi contain the graves of nine missionary infants. Other missionary children died in similarly large numbers—relative to the total European population—at the Moravian mission stations in Kyelang (Lahul) and Poo (Kinnaur).

In addition to these cemeteries, there are a number of isolated graves. These include the last resting place of Captain Herbert W. Christian who died of fever in Suru in 1896, and is buried in Pangher. Next to his tomb is a monument of loose stones and a granite slab to Chimed Gergan, the son of the Moravian pastor Joseph Gergan, who was killed by kuth smugglers in 1929. There are other isolated graves in Kital Nallah Suru, commemorating Richard Edward Genge, a military surgeon killed in an avalanche; in the Changchenmo Valley, in memory of Captain James Basevi of the Great Trigonometrical Survey; and at Daulat Beg Oldie, near the Karakoram Pass. The name Daulat Beg Oldie commemorates a Yarkandi trader who died in a blizzard. Stone plaques there commemorate an expedition by Dr Visser, a Dutch explorer who visited the region in the 1920s and 1930s; and Kaivan Mistry, an Indian national who drowned in the Shyok river in 2000.

Finally, the booklet contains information on European graves in Baltistan (three missionary infants and a soldier), and on the graves of Moravian missionaries from Ladakh who died in England. It concludes with a bibliography and an index of names and places.

Altogether, this is an interesting and imaginatively produced booklet. It is marred by a number of historical errors and anachronisms. For example, Zorawar Singh was not the Maharaja of Kashmir, but a general in the service of the Raja of Jammu; W.H. Johnson was the Wazir of Ladakh in Kashmir government service, not the British Joint Commissioner; Stoliczka was of Czech origin, but died 120 years too early to be 'a citizen of the Czech Republic'. There are also a series of typographical errors. For example, 'Stoliczka' is consistently misspelt 'Stoliezka'; 'ging heim' ('went

home')—the phrase often used on Moravian tombstones—should be two words, not one. It is to be hoped that these shortcomings will be corrected in a new edition.

***Bulletin of Tibetology* 38, No. 2. Gangtok: Namgyal Institute of Tibetology. 63 pp.**

The Namgyal Institute of Tibetology was founded in 1958, and started publishing its *Bulletin* six years later. In the summer of 2002 Tashi Densapa took over as director, and it was decided to bring up the Institute's research and publications programmes to 'international standards of scholarship'. As part of that programme, the *Bulletin* has been relaunched, and this volume is the result.

This edition contains two articles. The first is by Anna Balicki Denjongpa, and discusses 'Kanchen dzö nga: Secular and Buddhist Perceptions of the Mountain Deity of Sikkim among the Lhopos'. Anna received her Ph.D in social anthropology from the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) in London with a thesis on Buddhism and Shamanism in Village Sikkim (2002). The second article is by Dasho Tenzin Dorje and written in Tibetan. It documents 'Marriage Customs and Practices of the Me rag Sag tseng nomads ('Brog pas) of Bkra shis sngang, Eastern Bhutan.' Dasho Tenzin Dorje is a retired Bhutanese official, originally from Tashigang district.

The Institute's objective is to sponsor research on the religion, history, language, art and culture of the people of the whole 'Tibetan cultural area.' However, it naturally has a particular focus on Sikkim and the Eastern Himalayas. In the immediate future its projects include: the documentation of the social history of Sikkim's 60-odd monasteries; a project to collect and digitalise old photographs of Sikkim; a visual anthropology project; the republication of rare books; and an international inter-disciplinary seminar in honour of famous Sikkimese scholars in 2004.

All this evokes comparisons with Ladakh, and the work of the Institute will be of great interest to scholars interested in comparative studies of the Himalayas. The Institute's website is currently under construction on www.tibetology.com. Subscriptions to the *Bulletin* cost Rs 120 per year in India, and \$15 abroad. The journal is currently bi-annual, and may soon increase its frequency to three times a year.

NEW BOOKS

Identity, Ritual and State in Tibetan Buddhism: The Foundations of Authority in Gelukpa Monasticism.

by Martin Mills

RoutledgeCurzon Studies in Tantric Traditions. London: RoutledgeCurzon Press. ISBN: 0-7007-1470-7. 404 pp, 12 plates, 8 figures. hb/GBP 60,00

“Identity, Ritual and State in Tibetan Buddhism is a major anthropological study of the place of monasticism, tantra and the institution of re-incarnation within Tibetan religious culture. Based on a nineteen-month field study of the Gelukpa monastery of Kumbum and its surrounding villages within the Ladakh region of North-West India—where the monastic traditions of Tibet have continued unbroken into the modern era—it explores the fundamental principles of religious authority carved out in Tibet over the last 800 years.”

“Identity, Ritual and State explores the tantric and monastic traditions of Tibetan Buddhism as they have been integrated into more localised understandings of the body, landscape and cosmology. Containing detailed descriptions and analyses of monastic ritual at Kumbum, and comparative material from the wider Tibetan cultural area, it proposes a substantial re-evaluation of the role of monks and incarnates as ritual performers, and its consequences for our understanding of religious rule in traditional Tibet.”

**INTO THE HIGH RANGES:
The Penguin Book of Mountain Writings**
edited by Ravina Aggarwal

Penguin India
ISBN 0143029118, 248 pages pb., INR 250

“Cold and forbidding to some. A comfort and solace to others. India’s mountainscapes are a testimony to the endurance of the human spirit. From the Himalayas in the north to the Nilgiris in the south, there exist a diverse range of physical, cultural, and aesthetic lifestyles. Into the High Ranges brings together essays and creative works by some of India’s best-known contemporary writers as well as fresh writings by other authors whose imaginations have been fired by these high reaches. Covering a broad spectrum of themes that delve into literature, history, culture and politics, these narratives present an intimate view that differs from stereotypical musings on mountains. [. . .] With an insightful introduction by Ravina Aggarwal, this anthology is essential reading for the mountain lover and armchair traveller alike.” (from the cover text)

TRANCE, BESESSENHEIT UND AMNESIE

Bei den Schamanen der Changpa-Nomaden
im ladakhischen Changthang

Ina Rösing

Unter Mitarbeit von
Hans-Ulrich Pfeilsticker, Reinhardt Rüdell und Peter F. Tkaczyk

Gnas (Austria), Herbert Weishaupt Verlag
March 2003
ISBN 3-7059-0174-5
17,4x24,5cm
ca. 264 pp, ca. 40 colour ill
hb _42,90

“This book is about the shamans of the Changpa nomads living on the high plateau of Ladakh’s Changthang. With respect to their social structures and religious and ritual orientation (Buddhism and Shamanism), the Changpa nomads belong to the Tibetan cultural sphere. Modernity, which has also reached their remote world, dramatically challenges the basis of their way of life.

Their traditional healers, the shamans, see the disease of modernity most clearly. They see this new era during visionary trances and possession by deities, and when one listens to their trance-songs in which the violent character of our time is discussed (“more blood flows down the valleys”), their warnings have an eerie actuality. [. . .] The trance of the Ladakhi shamans is followed by hermetic amnesia. In this report the ways in which one might understand the Shamans despite their amnesia, and how one might decipher their bridging of old and new times, and thereby also their message for us.”

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF LADAKH SUPPLEMENT NO. 14

by John Bray

This supplement lists additions to updates in previous editions of Ladakh Studies and in my Bibliography of Ladakh (Warminster: Aris & Phillips, 1988). Entries marked with an asterisk have not been seen by the compiler. Please send new references and suggested annotations to John Bray (1208, 2-14-1 Furuishiba, Koto-ku, Tokyo 135-0045, Japan; JNBray1957@yahoo.co.uk)

- Aggarwal, Ravina. 2001. "At the Margins of Death: Ritual Space and the Politics of Location in an Indo-Himalayan Border Village." *American Ethnologist* 28, No. 3, pp. 549-573. ■ Prompted by an incident at a funeral ceremony in Achinathang, the author discusses different kinds of margins and boundaries. These include boundaries between death and rebirth, 'Buddhism in contested fields', and the role of the ethnographer - an urban outsider in rural Ladakh.
- Aggarwal, Ravina. 2002. "Learning from Mountains." In *Into the High Ranges. The Penguin Book of Mountain Writings*, pp.175-186. Edited by Ravina Aggarwal. New Delhi: Penguin. ■ Reminiscences of encounters with the author's Ladakhi teacher 'Aba'.
- Ahmed, Monisha. 2001. "Making Cloth - Gender and Place in Rupshu (Eastern Ladakh)." In *The Human Landscape*, pp.149-159. Edited by Geeti Sen and Ashis Banerjee, New Delhi: India International Centre and Orient Longman. ■
- Ahmed, Monisha. 2002 (a). *Living Fabric: Weaving Among the Nomads of Ladakh Himalaya*. Bangkok: Orchid Press. 192 pp. colour, b/w illus. maps. ■ Studies the tradition of weaving among nomadic pastoralists of Rupshu. Discusses weaving in relation to gender, kinship, hierarchical and spatial relations.
- Ahmed, Monisha. 2002 (b). "The Goat in the Shawl." In *Into the High Ranges. The Penguin Book of Mountain Writings*, pp.187-200. Edited by Ravina Aggarwal. New Delhi: Penguin. ■ Short story describing Rupshu nomads and their dealings with pashmina traders from Leh.
- Bhasin, Veena. 1999. *Tribals of Ladakh: Ecology, Human Settlements and Health*. Delhi: Kamla-Raj Enterprises. 258 pp. illus, maps. ■* Sections on climate, history, economy, health. Cited in DK Agencies and Indus Books online catalogues.
- De Rossi Filibeck, Elena. 2002. "A Description of Spyi ti by J. Gergan." In *Territory and Identity in Tibet and the Himalayas*, pp. 313-324. Edited by Katia Buffetrille & Hildegaard Diemberger. PIATS 2000. Leiden: Brill. ■ Annotated translation of section on Spyi ti in Joseph Gergan's history of Ladakh (Gergan 1976).
- Dodin, Thierry. 2002. "The Ladakh Budh Vihar of Delhi: the Fate of a Ladakhi Outpost in the Indian Capital. In *Tibet Past and Present*, pp. 387-414. Tibetan Studies 1. PIATS 2000. Edited by Henk Blezer. Leiden: Brill. ■ Discusses the history and local politics of the Ladakh Budh Vihar from its foundation in the 1960s onwards.
- Donsen, Michel. 1901. "Klein-Tibet." *Tijdschrift van het Koninklijk Nederlandsch Aardrijkskundig Genootschap* 18, second series, pp. 416-462. ■ Describes the geography of Ladakh; its political status; the characteristics of the local population; and Buddhist beliefs and rituals including birth rituals, marriage ceremonies and funeral rites. Author was a Roman Catholic missionary in Leh.

- Gielen, Uwe. 2001. "Some Themes in the Ethos of Traditional Buddhist Ladakh." In *LHOEE2*, pp.115-126. ■ Revised version of an article first published in 1985. Draws on structured interviews, using case studies of moral dilemmas, to draw general conclusions on Ladakhi Buddhist ethos. Includes 'some afterthoughts in 2000'.
- Goepper, Roger. 1990. "Clues for a Dating of the Three-storeyed Temple in Alchi, Ladakh." *Asiatische Studien: Zeitschrift der Schweizerischen Gesellschaft für Asienkunde* 44, No. 2, pp. 159-175. ■ * Cited in Papa-Kalantari 2002.
- Goepper, Roger. 1993. "Early Kashmiri Textiles? Painted Ceilings in Alchi." *Transactions of the Oriental Ceramic Society* 56 (1991-1992), pp. 47-74. ■ * Cited in Papa-Kalantari 2002.
- Goepper, Roger. 1995. "Dressing the Temple, Textile Representations in the Frescoes at Alchi. In *Asian Art*. The Second Hali Annual, pp.100-117. ■ * Cited in Papa-Kalantari 2002.
- Goepper, Roger. 1997. "The Murals of Alchi." In *Tibetan Art: Towards a Definition of Style*, pp. 134-148. Edited by J.C. Singer and P. Denwood. London. ■ * Cited in Papa-Kalantari 2002.
- Hewson, Eileen. 2002. *Himalayan Headstones from Ladakh Kashmir*. London: British Association for Cemeteries in South Asia. 34 pp. illus. maps. ■ Catalogues graves and other monuments to Europeans who died in Ladakh in the 19th and 20th centuries. Includes pictures and short biographical information.
- Howard, Neil F. 2002. "The Political Geography of South-east Zanskar, and a Reconsideration of The Royal Chronologies of Zanskar and Ladakh in The 15th Century." *South Asian Studies* 18, pp. 91-108. London: Society for South Asian Studies. ■ Re-evaluates chronology of 15th century kings of Ladakh, drawing on records of historical events and associated land revenue bequests to Phugthal monastery.
- Jina, Prem Singh. 1999. *Some Monasteries of Drigung Pa Order in Central Ladakh*. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications. xiv, 111 pp. ■ * Cited in DK Agencies online catalogue.
- Kapadia, Harish. 2001. *High Himalaya Unknown Valleys*. With a foreword by Sir Chris Bonnington. New Delhi: Indus. 336 pp. illus. maps. ■ Articles on the author's explorations in the last 30 years across the Himalayan region, including Ladakh and the Eastern Karakoram.
- Kapadia, Harish. 2002. "The Saga of Siachen." In *Into the High Ranges. The Penguin Book of Mountain Writings*, pp. 203-217. Edited by Ravina Aggarwal. New Delhi: Penguin. ■ Summarises the history of the Siachen glacier, and tells of his own explorations there.
- Kaplanian, Patrick. 2001 (a). "Les verités de l'interpretation: jalousie, possession et guérison au Ladakh." *LHOEE2*, pp. 159-166. ■ Questions the pertinence and efficacy of Western psychoanalysis in Ladakhi society with reference to local concepts of possession by spirits.
- Kaplanian, Patrick. 2001 (b). "Le jour de l'an à Choglamsar." *LHOEE2*, pp. 183-209. ■ Detailed description of Choglamsar New Year festival.

- Kazmi, Syed Muhamad Abbas. 1996. "The Balti Language". In Jammu, Kashmir and Ladakh. Linguistic Predicament, pp. 135-153. Edited by P.N. Pushp and K. Warikoo. New Delhi: Har Anand. ■ Summarises the language's history and evolution.
- Kozics, Gerald. 2002. "The Wanla Temple." In Buddhist Art and Tibetan Patronage. Ninth to Fourteenth Centuries, pp. 127-136. Edited by Deborah E. Klimberg & Eva Allinger. PIATS 2000. Leiden: Brill. ■ Illustrated report on an architectural survey of the temple in 1998.
- Linrothe, R.N. 1999. "Talisman, Reliquary and Instrument of Enlightenment: The Alchi Sumtsek as a Mandalic Site." Orientations 30, No. 1, pp. 22-29. ■ * Cited in Papa-Kalantari 2002.
- Loewert, Françoise. 2001. "L'autre en soi (à propos des gongmo)." LHOEE2, pp. 167-182. ■ Discusses phenomenon of possession by gongmo spirits.
- Luczanits, Christian. 1997. "On an Unusual Painting Style in Ladakh". In The Inner Asian International Style 12th-14th Centuries, pp. 151-169. PIATS 1995, Vol 7. Edited by D.E. Klimburg-Salter and E. Alinger. Vienna: Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. ■ * Cited in Papa-Kalantari 2002.
- Luczanits, Christian. 2002. "The Wanla Bkra shis gsum brtsegs." In Buddhist Art and Tibetan Patronage Ninth to Fourteenth Centuries, pp. 115-125. Edited by Deborah E. Klimberg & Eva Allinger. PIATS 2000. Leiden: Brill. ■ Reviews the artistic decoration and historical context of the Wanla temple. Dates it to the early 14th century.
- Mills, Martin A. 2002. Identity, Ritual and State in Tibetan Buddhism. The Foundations of Authority in Gelukpa Monasticism. London: RoutledgeCurzon. 440 pp. ■ Based on research in Lingshed monastery. Contains detailed analyses of monastic ritual, and discusses Tibetan tantric traditions as they interact with more localised understandings of bodily identity and territorial cosmology.
- Mirmont, Paul. 2001. "Presentation technique du projet Ladakh." In LHOEE2, pp.19-20. ■ Outlines techniques for improving traditional Ladakhi dwellings using 'solar walls'.
- Neumaier, Eva K. 2002. "Historiography and the Narration of Cultural Identity in Zangskar." In Tibet Past and Present, pp. 327-342. Tibetan Studies 1. PIATS 2000. Edited by Henk Blezer. Leiden: Brill. ■ Zangskar is on the periphery of the Tibetan world, but Zangskaris nevertheless 'write themselves into a symbolic centre' of Tibetan culture in their historic texts.
- Pathak, S. K. 1996. "Generic Affinity of Balti, Bodhi, Spiti and Lahuli Speeches." In Jammu, Kashmir and Ladakh. Linguistic Predicament, pp. 154-164. Edited by P.N. Pushp and K. Warikoo. New Delhi: Har Anand. ■
- Papa-Kalantari, Christiane. 2002. "The Ceiling Paintings of the Alchi gsum brtsegs: Problems of Style." In Buddhist Art and Tibetan Patronage. Ninth to Fourteenth Centuries, pp. 85-113. Edited by Deborah E. Klimberg & Eva Allinger. PIATS 2000. Leiden: Brill. ■ Draws on an analysis of the textiles in the Alchi paintings to re-examine their art- historical context.
- Riaboff, Isabelle. 2002. "The Bod of Kabön (Jammu and Kashmir, India); How to be a Buddhist in a Hindu Land?" In Territory and Identity in Tibet and the Himalayas, pp. 325-339. Edited by Katia Buffetrille & Hildegaard Diemberger. PIATS 2000. Leiden: Brill. ■ Discusses religion and identity in a 'Bod' village on the Kishtiwari side of the mountains from Zangskar.

- Sharma, B.D. 1999. *Wild Animals of Ladakh. An Ecological Study of the Wildlife of High Altitude Animals of Ladakh, Jammu and Kashmir State.* Delhi: Asiatic Publishing House. 115pp., illus., maps. ■* From DK Agencies online catalogue.
- Shawe, Frederic Becker. 2002. "Journey to the Himalayas in 1890." *Moravian Mission Magazine* 21. Newtownabbey, Co. Antrim. 32 pp. ■ A Moravian missionary's account of his first journey from Karachi to Leh in 1890.
- Sheikh, Abdul Ghani. 2002. "The Wind." In *Into the High Ranges. The Penguin Book of Mountain Writings*, pp.234-239. Edited by Ravina Aggarwal. New Delhi: Penguin. ■ Short story set in a period of Buddhist/Muslim tensions.
- Shorter, Loïc. 2001. "Le Cham de Hemis." *LHOEE2*, pp. 153-158. ■ Analyses the annual monastic dances at the Hemis festival.
- Tanase, Jiro. 2001. *Indohimaraya no Chibetto sekai.* Tokyo: Ashashi Shoten. 212pp. illus. ■ Anthropological study of Kardang village in Lahul, with sections on the local economy, family, marriage, small deities, 'terton' text-discoverers and the 'search for a hidden country'.
- Takage, Shin-ya. 2001. *Radakku (Ladakh).* Tokyo: Ryok_jin. 175 pp. maps. illus. ■ Detailed Japanese-language guidebook with small black and white photos, local maps.
- Vohra, Rohit. 2001 (a). "Dards of Gurais & Titel in the Kishanganga Valley. A Preliminary Report." *LHOEE2*, pp. 137-141. ■ Inhabitants of Kishanganga valley (on the Kashmir side of the Zoji pass) form the largest group of Muslim Dards. Discusses historical references, socio-religious beliefs, and rites of passage.
- Vohra, Rohit. 2002. (b). "Remarks on the Early History of Ladakh. Rock Carving and Tibetan Inscriptions of the Late First Millennium and Early Centuries of the Second Millennium A.D." *LHOEE2*, pp. 143-147. ■ Historical notes and photographs of rock inscriptions (texts and stupas) near Khalatse.
- Wilson, Ariane. 2002. *Une violoncelle sur le toit du monde.* Paris: Presses de la Renaissance. 224 pp. illus. ■ Engaging account of 'two friends' journey through Zangskar in the company of a cello.

Abbreviations:

LHOEE2 *Ladakh Himalaya Occidental. Ethnologie, Écologie. Recherches Récentes sur le Ladakh* No. 2A.. Colloque organisé à Pau en janvier 1985 par Patrick Kaplanian et Claude Dendaletche. Seconde édition entièrement revue, corrigée et augmentée par Patrick Kaplanian. Paris: privately published by the editor (7 rue Neuve Popincourt, 75011 Paris), 2001.

PIATS *PIATS 2000. Proceedings of the Ninth Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies, Leiden 2000.*

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

David Mallon is a zoologist.

Rebecca Norman has lived in Ladakh since 1995. She wrote *Getting Started in Ladakhi*, and is compiling, very gradually, a new dictionary of Ladakhi.

Janet Rizvi is a historian living in Gurgaon.